

Running head: TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

MPC MAJOR RESEARCH PAPER

Trust Me, You Should Buy This: Cosmetic Marketing and Product Reviews on YouTube

JENNIFER SPITERI

Supervisor: Dr. Matthew Tiessen

The Major Research Paper is submitted
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Professional Communication

Ryerson University

Toronto, Ontario, Canada

Submitted August 15, 2017

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

AUTHOR'S DECLARATION FOR A SUBMISSION OF A MAJOR RESEARCH PAPER

I hereby declare that I am the sole author of this Major Research Paper and the accompanying Research Poster. This is a true copy of the MRP and the research poster, including any required final revisions, as accepted by my examiners.

I authorize Ryerson University to lend this Major Research Paper and/or poster to other institutions or individuals for the purpose of scholarly research.

I further authorize Ryerson University to reproduce this MRP and/or poster by photocopying or by other means, in total or in part, at the request of other institutions or individuals for the purpose of scholarly research.

I understand that my MRP and/or my MRP research poster may be made electronically available to the public.

Abstract

YouTube beauty gurus, in combination with traditional marketing and advertising techniques, manipulate the opinions of cosmetics consumers. Today, advertising techniques are not only being applied online by companies and corporations using conventional strategies (e.g. banner ads and text-based Google ads), but are becoming blended, integrated, and disguised as user-generated content. So-called “beauty gurus,” for example, are using online advertising platforms to spread messages that promote cosmetic products to the public on behalf of corporations. This paper will examine how beauty gurus on YouTube review products while offering advice that is accepted as truth on an allegedly democratic, or at least user-generated, online platform.

This Major Research Paper will examine the application of advertising models and propaganda techniques to YouTube beauty marketing using the insights of Edward S. Herman and Noam Chomsky (1988), as well as Edward Bernays (1935), whose ground-breaking and influential methods of analyzing advertising and public relations can offer new insights into contemporary online media and the ways these seemingly open platforms are being taken over by private interests and large corporations (all while projecting the images and ideals of authenticity, amateurism, and open access). This study will demonstrate that YouTube beauty reviews are a form of advertising that utilize trust and bias, two important factors that Herman and Chomsky (1988) and Bernays (1935) explore, in order to disguise advertising as individual opinion expressed in the interest of the consumer. My findings suggest that corporations have been able to adapt traditional methods of beauty marketing to YouTube (and, implicitly, other online video platforms beyond the scope of this study) through the use of “beauty gurus.”

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

Despite disclaimers in these “beauty gurus” YouTube channels that products have been sent to them for free, the lines between what constitutes an advertisement and what constitutes user generated content are being blurred. My suggestion is that this blurring leaves the public confused and more susceptible to influence within the realm of online beauty guides, reviews, and tutorials.

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my supervisor, Dr. Matthew Tiessen, for his guidance, support, and expertise. In addition, I would like to thank my second reader, Dr. John Shiga, for his valuable feedback and assistance.

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

Dedication

This paper is dedicated to Robert, Carol, and Julie. Thank you for making this possible.

Table of Contents

Author’s Declaration.....ii

Abstract.....iii

Acknowledgements.....v

Dedication.....vi

Table of Contents.....vii

List of Tables.....ix

List of Figures.....x

List of Appendices.....xi

1. Introduction.....1

2. Literature Review.....3

 2.1 Established Marketing Techniques: The History of Manipulating Public Opinion.....3

 2.2 Herman and Chomsky (1988): “Propaganda Model”.....4

 2.3 Bernays (1935): “Public Relations Program”.....5

 2.4 Selected Methods from Herman and Chomsky (1988) and Bernays (1935).....5

 2.4.1 Trust and Truth.....5

 2.4.2 Bias and Democracy.....7

 2.5 Advertising Techniques and YouTube Marketing Today.....8

 2.5.1 Advertising.....8

 2.5.2 Trust and Truth.....9

 2.5.3 Democracy.....10

3. Research Questions.....12

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

4. Methodology.....	13
4.1 Sample.....	13
5. Analysis.....	15
5.1 RQ1 Advertising.....	15
5.2 RQ2 Trust and Truth.....	17
5.3 RQ3 Bias and Democracy.....	19
6. Results.....	21
6.1 RQ1 Advertising.....	21
6.2 RQ2 Trust and Truth.....	25
6.3 RQ3 Bias and Democracy.....	29
7. Conclusion.....	35
References.....	82

List of Tables

Table 1: RQ1 Advertising Code Definitions.....	16
Table 2: RQ2 Trust and Truth Code Definitions.....	18
Table 3: RQ3 Bias and Democracy Code Definitions.....	20
Table 4: RQ1 Advertising Data Analysis.....	57
Table 5: RQ2 Trust and Truth Data Analysis.....	64
Table 6: RQ3 Bias and Democracy Data Analysis.....	73

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

List of Figures

Figure 1: Kylie Jenner Webpage.....24

List of Appendices

Appendix A: YouTube Transcriptions.....37

Appendix B: Table 4, Table 5, and Table 6.....58

1. Introduction

Although the idea that public opinion can be, and is being, “constructed” is not new (Lippmann, 1922), with the rise of social media, long existing marketing and advertising techniques used to construct public opinion have not only been applied to online media, but they have become blended and disguised as user-generated content. This has led to new and more subtle forms of public deception, since corporations have gained control over media outlets that are widely regarded as “democratic” spaces featuring user-generated content (Herman, 2000). This paper will examine these emerging methods of public manipulation. The research question that will drive my efforts is: How do corporations use YouTube beauty gurus, in combination with traditional marketing and advertising techniques, to manipulate cosmetics consumers’ opinions? To answer the primary research question, this study will grapple with the following three supporting questions:

RQ1: How can traditional advertising models be applied to YouTube advertising?

RQ2: How do corporations use beauty gurus to spread their messages to the public by offering advice that is accepted as truth?

RQ3: How are YouTube and influential YouTube beauty leaders used as a platform to reach and promote cosmetics to a vast audience?

There currently is little research or commentary on the corporatization of the beauty and cosmetics marketing sub-category on YouTube. That being the case, this study will examine how corporations are attempting to manipulate public opinion through advertising and marketing on YouTube. This area of research is relevant and essential because it raises important questions that

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

must be pondered as social media becomes more entrenched in contemporary culture.

Advertising, social media marketing, trust and truth, and bias and democracy are all umbrella terms that relate to, and will be addressed within, this study. Furthermore, traditional methods of media and advertising as a form of public control will be discussed from perspectives that both promote and critique these methods. My hope is that by gaining greater understanding of how traditional methods of advertising are being applied to YouTube marketing, these methods not only become visible to viewers, but will potentially afford viewers the ability to make more informed decisions in the future.

2. Literature Review

This literature review will begin with an introduction to established marketing techniques by examining the evolution of the manipulation of public opinion. This will lead to an in depth discussion of two important models or techniques, Herman and Chomsky's (1988) "Propaganda Model," outlined in the book *Manufacturing of Consent: The Political Economy of the Mass Media*, and Bernays' (1935) "Public Relations Program," developed in the work *Molding Public Opinion*. Once an understanding of the two works has been established, selected methods from these models will be explored that relate to trust and truth as well as to bias and democracy in advertising in order to gain a greater understanding of how the use of these themes can be applied to YouTube reviews and online advertising.

2.1 Established Marketing Techniques: The History of Manipulating Public Opinion

The intention of established marketing techniques, which control and influence the public, are discussed by authors such as Lippmann (1922), Bernays (1935), Herman and Chomsky (1988), and Herman (2000). Although these works focus on more traditional methods in marketing, advertising, and public relations, they can be divided into two categories, those that critically analyze these methods and those that promote them.

The literature within this area has been foundational for research on public opinion, and many of these works have influenced one another. Lippmann (1922) originally developed the term "manufacture of consent" to describe the control of the public's access to information through culture, the media, and politics (Chapter XV, para. 24). Manufacturing consent was utilized by those in power in order to limit the knowledge available, which allowed them to shape and control public opinion (Lippmann, 1922, Chapter XV, para. 23). Later, Herman and

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

Chomsky (1988) developed their theory of manufacturing consent, which examines how media propaganda influences the public. Herman (2000) re-analyzed this concept at a later date in relation to new-media advertising and public control, and he found the model increasingly relevant to today's media sources. But while the aforementioned theories either describe or critique emerging methods of public control, Bernays (1935) advocates for – or promotes – the use of public relations methods to control public opinion and thus to benefit the elite.

For this paper, Herman and Chomsky (1988) and Bernays (1935) will be key sources of information since they develop step-by-step methods or formulas that can be used to analyze, critique, and develop advertising, public relations strategies, and marketing. Although selected methods from these models will be used, in order to understand the context of these methods, the models must first be discussed in detail.

2.2 Herman and Chomsky (1988): “Propaganda Model”

With the construction of the “Propaganda Model,” Herman and Chomsky (1988) describe how the media is used to shape public opinion. The first step of the “Propaganda Model” is for the media to increase “the size, concentrated ownership, owner wealth, and profit orientation of the dominant mass media firms” in order to concentrate the power and media market share held by large media corporations (Herman & Chomsky, 1988, p. 2). The second step is to advertise as “the primary income source of mass media,” which emphasizes the reliance of media outlets on the profit that they make from corporations that pay to advertise (Herman & Chomsky, 1988, p. 2). The third step of the model focuses on “the reliance of the media on information provided by government, business, and ‘experts’ funded and approved by these primary agents of power,” which focuses on the limited selection of trusted sources of information, resulting in bias

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

(Herman & Chomsky, 1988, p. 2). The fourth component of the model is the generation of “‘flak’ as a means of disciplining the media,” flak being a method of creating fear for those who speak against a corporation (Herman & Chomsky, 1988, p. 2). Finally, the fifth step is the promotion of “‘anticommunism’ as a national religion and control mechanism” (Herman & Chomsky, 1988, p.2).

2.3 Bernays (1935): “Public Relations Program”

Bernays (1935) promotes four steps in his “Public Relations Program,” the key objective being to manipulate the public. The first step in the process is the “formulation of objectives” (Bernays, 1935, p. 85). With this step there is a focus on defining the interests of the public in relation to the interests of a corporation (Bernays, 1935). The second step is the “analysis of public attitude,” which involves developing an understanding of the current opinion of the public towards the promoted product (Bernays, 1935, p. 85-86). The third step is the “study of analysis,” which involves planning how the industry will take action, and the fourth step, “use of media,” focuses on implementing this action through the use of the media (Bernays, 1935, p. 86).

2.4 Selected Methods from Herman and Chomsky’s (1988) and Bernays’ (1935) Models

To focus my study, I will address two key areas, 1) trust and truth, and 2) bias and democracy, as they relate to online advertising. In so doing, I will be drawing on one of the methods discussed by Herman and Chomsky (1988) and two of the methods discussed by Bernays (1935).

2.4.1 Trust and Truth: The third step in Herman and Chomsky’s 1988 “Propaganda Model” is described as “the reliance of the media on information provided by [. . .] ‘experts’

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

funded and approved by these primary sources and agents of power” (Herman & Chomsky, 1988, p. 2). Because these experts are backed by corporations, they appear to be credible. Although this step refers to the reliance of media sources on “experts” for information, it can be applied to YouTube viewers and their reliance on allegedly amateur gurus serving as trustworthy “experts.” Herman and Chomsky (1988) note that official sources become overshadowed by unofficial sources simply because unofficial sources are backed by corporations. “Official sources” in the media can, for the purposes of this paper, be compared to truthful product reviews on YouTube, which are conducted by users who have purchased products themselves. However, these “official sources” or truly authentic reviewers are all-too-often dominated by “unofficial sources,” or those who appear to be trustworthy “experts,” because they are backed by corporations (Herman & Chomsky, 1988, p.23). This backing is done behind the scenes when corporations send free products to popular beauty gurus who have a significant number of followers/subscribers and are likely to receive a high number of views, in order to dominate online platforms with positive product reviews. As a result, positive messages about the product are spread and bias appears (online) as the truth.

Similarly, the second step in Bernays’ 1935 “Four Steps Essential to Formulate a [Public Relations] Program” (p. 85) can be discussed in relation to trust and truth. The step is the “Analysis of public attitude” which is “the analysis of the attitude of the public towards the industry [. . .] so that the industry may make whatever changes [. . .] or endeavor to educate the public to its own point of view” (Bernays, 1935, p. 85-86). This step suggests that in order to advertise effectively, a corporation requires an understanding of the current opinion of the public towards a product in order to influence them more effectively. In order to implement this step via

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

the internet, YouTube beauty gurus are a significant tool. This is because corporations can influence the public's opinion of a product by addressing their concerns through a trusted guru on YouTube and by harvesting the user data associated with a given guru's account (e.g. demographics, time on site, country of origin of users, etc.).

2.4.2 Bias and Democracy: The third step in Herman and Chomsky's (1988) "Propaganda Model" also refers to how "expert" sources of information contribute to the perpetuation of bias. Herman and Chomsky (1988) note that these sources must maintain their positive relationships with corporations, and therefore they may spread biased news in order to do so. Beauty gurus' biased opinions align with this step since they are likely to be influenced by the expectation to maintain their positive relationship with the corporation that is providing them with free products for review. While gurus who have been sent products for free are likely to express biased opinions, their beauty reviews on YouTube are framed as unbiased to their users. Unlike an advertisement that is deliberately labeled or recognized as biased or motivated, popular YouTube gurus are an effective and niche platform capable of successfully transferring biased messages to viewers on behalf of corporations. This is because gurus have the power to share their "opinion," while presumably granting the viewer the freedom to come to their own conclusions based on these "opinions" and to offer these opinions in the comments section of their YouTube channels.

The fourth step in Bernays' (1935) "Four Steps Essential to Formulate A [Public Relations] Program" is called "Use of Media" (p. 87). It describes how corporations must select the correct medium to spread a message positively and consistently. Bernays' observation can be applied to the use of YouTube beauty gurus as a medium, because they are likely to spread a

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

positive message about a product in return for receiving it for free. The public then has access to consistent and positive product reviews from multiple popular gurus, leading them to believe that they are making well informed purchases.

2.5 Advertising Techniques and YouTube Marketing Today

2.5.1 Advertising: Kaur et al. (2013) use critical discourse analysis to examine beauty product advertisements and their typical components. Kaur et al. (2013) list the detailed components of an advertisement as: product information and history, expected results, testimonials and endorsements from celebrities, and cost. This list is useful when comparing YouTube beauty tutorials to more conventional forms of advertising. For example, using celebrities in advertising is somewhat similar to using beauty gurus as a platform to achieve the marketing goals of a company. Androulaki (2015) explores this area in depth and makes connections between YouTube advertising and beauty gurus as leaders. The components of a conventional beauty advertisement can be compared to YouTube advertising. While a YouTuber may claim that their video is not an advertisement, the content is likely to align with one, along with its purpose.

An understanding of traditional beauty product advertising in relation to “new” methods of beauty advertising online are essential in order to address how corporations use YouTube beauty gurus, in combination with traditional marketing and advertising techniques, to manipulate cosmetic consumers’ opinions. Cosmetics and beauty have been explored in relation to audiences from positive and negative perspectives, and the way that the public perceives a product is important to understand prior to trying to control messages (Bernays, 1935). In the twentieth century industrialization and capitalism surged and the role of cosmetics in culture

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

changed. During this period, Baudelaire (1995) tried to understand ideas surrounding makeup and the enhancement of beauty in a positive and artistic light. In comparison, Baudrillard (1990) criticized the deceptive power of cosmetics. Even today cosmetics and beauty remains a debated topic. Lazar's (2011) work, for example, explores beauty and consumer identity and attempts to demonstrate how cosmetics in advertising are framed positively as post-feminist, linked to freedom, and promoted as a form of artistic talent. It appears that today beauty product advertisements are regarded as being a part of multiple cultural contexts, which is important considering YouTube is a global platform (Woodward-Smith & Eynullaeva, 2009).

2.5.2 Trust and Truth: Recent articles that explore social media advertising techniques assist in examining how traditional marketing is applied to YouTube advertising. The marketing techniques used on social media are explored by researchers such as Kim (2012), Fisher (2015), Lee and Watkins (2016), and Wu (2016). All of their works explore a consistent theme in advertising online, which is trust. Establishing trust is key in online advertising. A significant method of advertising in connection with trust appears to be the use of celebrities or widely recognized people (Lee & Watkins, 2016). Fisher (2015), who used Facebook as a case study to examine audience labour, found that leadership and trusted sources of information are a key component of advertising. This relates to my research since celebrity gurus are portrayed as trusted leaders and friends (Fisher, 2015). By extension, gurus are a particularly effective form of advertising because they have a pre-established follower base, which makes it easier for corporations to target and spread their messages to the appropriate audiences (Fisher, 2015). Quandt's (2012) literature on the growing sense of online trust, due to a lack of trust in the media, is also useful in understanding why gurus are trusted.

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

2.5.3 Bias and Democracy: The spread of biased messages is allowed for by democracy. Corporations have control over the messages that consumers receive, as well as the ones that they do not. Lee and Watkins (2016), who use para-social interaction and social comparison theories to analyze YouTube's influence on luxury brands, note that companies may pay YouTubers to promote their products. Alternatively, a company may provide a guru with free products to review, resulting in bias and corporate power to influence the messages that consumers receive. Furthermore, YouTubing can be expensive, and those who create videos but are not sent products for free must put in more effort and funding to create their own content. In comparison, those who are sent products for free on a large scale, can earn a living based on creating product reviews. Providing YouTubers with free products enables them to produce videos more frequently, and this influence over the frequency of videos that specific users can make grants corporations greater power over the messages that consumers receive.

Of course, since these "beauty guru" videos are very advertising-like, the legality of these YouTube videos is also an issue that must be taken into consideration since they're capable of manipulating consumers and communicating biased messages. Regarding the legality issue, Wu (2016), who categorizes different types of YouTube marketing, identifies three types of YouTube endorsements: 1) "direct sponsorship," 2) "affiliated links" or "commission," and 3) "free product sampling where companies send products to YouTubers with the hope that they will create product reviews, advertorials, and just general exposure of the product" (p. 3). The third category of YouTube marketing that Wu (2016) identifies, free product sampling, is the main focus of this MRP. According to the Federal Trade Commission (2015), if a blogger is sent a product for free from a company, and they believe that the credibility of their review will be

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

affected, they are expected to note that they received the product for free in their review (When does the FTC Act apply section, para. 1). In addition, the FTC (2015) notes that receiving a product for free is categorized as an “endorsement” (Disclose an endorsement section, para. 1). While sponsored or affiliate videos have straightforward guidelines that always require disclosure (Wu, 2016, p. 25), based on the FTC (2015) guidelines, Wu notes that the disclosure guidelines of a free product are “less clear” (p. 26). This is because disclosure depends on the specific case, and as stated on the FTC website, it is up to the discretion of the reviewer (When does the FTC Act apply section, para. 1). While YouTube reviewers should ideally notify their audience that they have been sent products for free in order to comply with the law, this does not guarantee reliability or consistency in their revelations. At the same time, giving a simple disclaimer does not eliminate the issues that arise from the bias and the manipulation tactics that exist throughout these reviews.

3. Research Questions

Based on the themes that arose from the literature review, the three supporting research questions that will focus this study are:

RQ1: How can traditional advertising models be applied to YouTube advertising?

RQ2: How do corporations use beauty gurus to spread their messages to the public by offering advice that is accepted as truth?

RQ3: How are YouTube and influential YouTube beauty leaders used as a platform to reach and promote cosmetics to a vast audience?

4. Methodology

This study focuses on the analysis of three YouTube videos created by three different YouTube beauty gurus. The videos are reviews of the same brand and type of product: Kylie Cosmetics Eyeshadow Palettes. YouTube was selected as the media platform because the content is popular, accessible, convenient, interactive, democratic, and contains frequently updated and recent data.

4.1 Sample

The videos selected are by beauty gurus: NikkieTutorials (2016) (<https://www.youtube.com/user/NikkieTutorials>), Manny Mua (2016) (<https://www.youtube.com/user/MannyMua733>), and Jaclyn Hill (2016) (<https://www.youtube.com/user/Jaclynhill1>). NikkieTutorials' (2016) review is ten minutes and fourteen seconds long, Manny Mua's (2016) video is ten minutes and fifty three seconds long, and Jaclyn Hill's (2016) review is the longest, at eighteen minutes and forty seven seconds. The transcripts of each video were typed out using the subtitles provided by YouTube and are included in the Appendices.

These three videos were chosen because they can be identified as promotional and they are comparable to an advertisement. After watching multiple video reviews of Kylie Jenner Palettes, the videos with at least one verbalized disclaimer that the guru was sent the product for free (in order to comply with the FTC) were selected. Furthermore, reviews that discussed the products in a positive light were chosen.

These reviews were also selected because they have been designed to be considered "trustworthy" by audiences. Upon using both the search terms "Kylie Jenner Palette" and "Kylie Cosmetics Palette" on YouTube, these three reviews were on the first or second pages of results.

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

This means that these are gurus who people like to watch, who have upwards of one million subscribers, and who are regarded by their audiences as experienced and trusted.

The gurus in the three videos are popular gurus, with a wide reach of at least one million subscribers each. NikkieTutorials has over 7.5 million subscribers, Manny Mua has over 3 million subscribers, and Jaclyn Hill has over 4 million subscribers. Furthermore, the selected videos have a wide audience reach. NikkieTutorials' (2016) review has over 1.6 million views, Manny Mua's (2016) review has over five hundred thousand views, and Jaclyn Hill's (2016) review has over 2.9 million views. Therefore, it is fair to say that these reviewers have influence over a vast number of people, and their bias and opinions can be an influential factor among viewers and consumers. Admittedly, the sample size collected is modest, due to the scope of this MRP. Therefore, this is not a representative sample and one cannot make assumptions regarding the whole population of beauty gurus. Non-probability sampling was used, as the sampling selection was not random, and it was instead based on convenience sampling.

The research method used to conduct this study is a content analysis of the three YouTube videos. Coding was used to analyze the data, combining qualitative analysis with a deductive approach. Each video was transcribed and reviewed for general concepts or ideas that fall under a code, after which the research was analyzed and findings and codes were categorized and placed into three charts, as they relate to advertising methods, trust and truth, and bias and democracy. The findings are examined using the selected methods developed by Herman and Chomsky (1988) and Bernays (1935).

The transcriptions of the three videos can be found in Appendix A. The detailed data analysis can be found in Appendix B. In the data analysis, important quotations from the three

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

transcripts have been coded based on the three themes related to each research question (advertising techniques, trust and truth, and bias and democracy). Codes and their corresponding quotations related to the theme “advertising” from research question 1 are indicated in Table 4. Codes and their corresponding quotations related to the theme “trust” and “truth” from research question 2 are indicated in Table 5. Codes and their corresponding quotations related to the theme “bias” and “democracy” from research question 3 are indicated in Table 6.

5. Analysis

5.1 RQ1 Advertising

To address research question 1, “How can traditional advertising models be applied to YouTube advertising?,” content analysis will be used. The three YouTube videos will be coded and analyzed based on the components of a typical beauty advertisement, which will allow for a review of how these categories comply with the “traditional” aspects of advertisements in general. Kaur’s (2013) critical analysis of the typical components of a beauty advertisement, such as product type and information, endorsement by a celebrity, price, and effectiveness, will assist in conducting this analysis. To do this, the transcripts will be coded using the following categories: disclaimer, public figure, self promotion, product endorsement, product and brand history, product information, product price, product effectiveness, and bandwagon. This data will then be used to analyze how each video resembles an advertisement, which will assist me in applying Bernays’ (1935) and Herman and Chomsky’s (1988) requirements for an advertisement.

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

Table 1

RQ1 Advertising Code Definitions

Category Name	Codes In Category	Definition
Advertising	1 Disclaimer	Explanations of the reviewers relationship with the company and declarations that a product has been sent to the reviewer for free
	2 Public Figure	Reference to a celebrity or an indication of the reviewer's status as a public figure
	3 Self Promotion	Mention or promotion of a reviewer's own products, channel, videos, social media, etc.
	4 Product Endorsement	A positive recommendation of the overall product or a recommendation that the viewer should purchase the product
	5 Product and Brand History	Discussion of the brand and product history, including past product comparisons
	6 Product Information	Facts about and descriptions of the product
	7 Product Price	Mention of the monetary cost of product
	8 Product Effectiveness	Declarations of whether or not the product works, including how well
	9 Bandwagon	References to others' general, collective opinions about the product

5.2 RQ2 Trust and Truth

In order to delve deeper into the analysis and to answer RQ2, “How do corporations use beauty gurus to spread their messages to the public by offering advice that is accepted as truth?” data from the three videos that pertains to trust will be discussed. Specifically, content analysis will be used in order to understand how YouTube gurus use trust to communicate desired messages on behalf of corporations. This will be done by recording all of the scenarios in which the YouTube reviewers reassure the audience that they are to be trusted. To do this, the transcripts will be coded using the following categories: personal experience, the law, addressing ethical concerns, naivety, convinced trust, honesty, friendliness, inclusive language, addressing the audience, visual proof, opinion, and advice giving. In order to understand how the theme of trust relates back to traditional advertising methods, the identified methods used in the videos will be compared to Herman and Chomsky’s discussion of trusted sources of information (1988) and Bernays’ discussion of making ideas appealing to the public (1935).

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

Table 2

RQ2 Trust and Truth Code Definitions

Category Name	Codes In Category	Definition
Trust and Truth	1 Personal Experience	Reference to past personal experience, to create an expert persona
	2 The Law	Reference to their compliance with the law and FTC regulations to instill trust
	3 Addressing Ethical Concerns	Reassurance that the review will not be influenced by being sent the free product
	4 Naivety	Exclamations of no prior knowledge that the product or PR package was being sent to them for free
	5 Convinced Trust	Requests for the viewer to trust them, such as, “trust me” or “believe me,” etc.
	6 Honesty	Reassurance of honesty, such as, “honest,” “honestly,” “not going to lie,” etc.
	7 Friendliness	Evoking a sense of closeness, familiarity, and friendship
	8 Inclusive Language	Language that suggests the viewer is a part of the review process, such as, “let’s,” “we,” etc.
	9 Addressing the Audience	Speaking directly to the audience
	10 Visual Proof	Phrases that suggest the viewer has visual proof of the product’s effectiveness, such as, “see,” “look,” and “zoom in”
	11 Opinion	Protecting statements by labelling them as one’s subjective opinion
	12 Advice Giving	Suggestions tailored to specific types of viewers with their best interest in mind

5.3 RQ3 Bias and Democracy

To answer RQ3, “How are YouTube and influential YouTube beauty leaders used to reach and promote cosmetics to a vast audience?,” the collected data, based on the three videos, will be used to understand how the YouTube reviewers and their messages are framed as unbiased and democratic. This will be done through a specific focus on how the YouTube reviewer influences the viewer to believe that they have the freedom to form their own opinions, despite the subtle positive influences and bias perpetuated in their reviews. In order to do this, content analysis will be used to examine how the use of this media platform exudes a sense of democracy and freedom to choose based on the reviewer's advice, in comparison to the bias through positive associations that the guru connects to the product. In order to sort the information, the following categories will be used: potential bias, positive language, less-positive language, negative language, self-blame, personal preferences, and democratic. In order to understand how the reviewers promote the products while still allowing the audience to feel that they can develop their own unbiased and informed opinions, I will apply Herman and Chomsky's (1988) discussion of democracy and anticommunism in advertising, in combination with Bernays' (1935) discussion of using the media appropriately to reach a large number of people.

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

Table 3

RQ3 Bias and Democracy Code Definitions

Category Name	Codes In Category	Definition
Bias and Democracy	1 Potential Bias	Instances where the reviewer's opinion may be influenced by receiving the free product
	2 Positive Language	Expressions of approval: "like," "love," "pretty," "beautiful," etc.
	3 Less-Positive Language	Language that expresses disappointment, but does not outwardly state dislike
	4 Negative Language	Clear expressions of dislike
	5 Self-Blame	Blaming a product's lack of effectiveness on their own misuse/application, or suggesting that the user needs to use the product a certain way for it to be effective
	6 Personal Preferences	Attributing a response to personal likes or dislikes
	7 Democratic	Highlighting the democracy of YouTube, e.g. giving the viewer the chance to share their opinion, or expressing their own use of YouTube to share a personal opinion

6. Results: Findings and Discussion

6.1 RQ1 Advertising

Prior to providing an in depth analysis of how the three YouTube videos align with step three from Herman and Chomsky's "Propaganda Model" (1988), and steps two and three from Bernays' "Public Relations Program" (1935), an understanding of how the practice of YouTube reviews align with a general beauty advertisement must be established and applied to the three selected reviews.

NikkieTutorials' (2016) review contained many of the codes that an advertisement would. Firstly, the disclaimer that NikkieTutorials (2016) received the product for free from Kylie Cosmetics is an indication that the product was sent to her for review, which allows for potential bias (Appendix B, Table 4, #1). In an attempt to highlight that the video is not biased, NikkieTutorials (2016) references the law, as she mentions that if she was sponsored "it would be illegal" for her not to tell her audience (Appendix B, Table 4, #1). However, she fails to mention that she had to include that she received the product for free, as it would also be illegal for her not to disclose this to her audience. This is because the FTC (2015) considers reviewing a free product with the expectation of a review an endorsement (When does the FTC Act apply section, para. 1). Therefore, although NikkieTutorials (2016) claims that her video is not sponsored, in order to diminish and clear assumptions that her video is an advertisement, it can still be considered a form of endorsement (Appendix B, Table 4, #4).

NikkieTutorials' (2016) video contains the information that Kaur et al. (2013) note detailed beauty advertisements contain: product information and history, expected results, testimonials and endorsements promoted by celebrities, and cost. The review contains product

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

information and history (Kaur et al. 2013), as the product is described (Appendix B, Table 4, #6), along with the Kylie Cosmetics brand and the product history (see Appendix B, Table 4, #5).

Although expected results (Kaur et al. 2013) are not directly stated, NikkieTutorials (2016) sums up her experience by discussing how effective the product is, and therefore she sets expectations for the audience, who may be interested in purchasing the product (Appendix B, Table 4, #8).

Testimonials and endorsements promoted by celebrities (Kaur et al. 2013) applies, as the review itself is a testimonial by a popular public figure (Appendix B, Table 4, #2), who notes that the product is a “huge yes” (Appendix B, Table 4, #4). Furthermore, the product itself is created and promoted by Kylie Jenner, a famous celebrity (Appendix B, Table 4, #2). Cost also applies (Kaur et al. 2013), as the product price is mentioned in the video (see Appendix B, Table 4, #7).

Manny Mua’s (2016) review contains a disclaimer that the product was sent to him for free, followed by reassurances that his review was not influenced by this fact (Appendix B, Table 4, #1). Although this statement is made to dispel the idea that the video is an endorsement, Manny Mua’s (2016) review meets the basic content of an advertisement. It contains product information and history (Kaur et al. 2013), as the product is explained (Appendix B, Table 4, #6), and the brand and history is discussed (Appendix B, Table 4, #5). The product effectiveness is positively reviewed (appendix B, Table 4, #8), which establishes high expected results for viewers looking to purchase the palette (Kaur et al. 2013). The review itself is a testimonial or endorsement promoted by a public figure (Kaur et al. 2013), as Manny Mua (2016) endorses the product by noting that it is “worth the price” (Appendix B, Table 4, #4). Furthermore he promotes himself and his brand by encouraging viewers to follow him (Appendix B, Table 4,

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

#2). Finally, the cost of the product (Kaur et al. 2013) is discussed on multiple occasions (Appendix B, Table 4, #7).

Jaclyn Hill's (2016) review contains a disclaimer in which she states that she received the palette for free, and she notes that she is not being paid for her video review (Appendix B, Table 4, #1). However, Kylie Jenner uses Jaclyn Hill's (2016) video review as promotional content on her website (see Figure 1). Therefore, the video is being used for advertising purposes by the corporation.



Figure 1. Kylie Jenner (n.d.). *Jaclyn Hill's First Impression of Kyshadow*. Retrieved from <https://www.thekyliejenner.com/glam/1121-kylie-jenner-jaclyn-hill-first-impression-kyshadow/>

Jaclyn Hill's (2016) video review also contains similar content to an advertisement. The product information and history are discussed (Kaur et al. 2013), since she gives details about the product (Appendix B, Table 4, #6) and briefly mentions past products from the brand (Appendix B, Table 4, #5). She also covers product effectiveness, which establishes a set of expected results (Kaur et al. 2013) because she describes the product as "applying beautifully" and compares its quality to other popular brands (Appendix B, Table 4, #8). As Jaclyn Hill can be considered a public figure (Appendix B, Table 4, #2), her testimonials and endorsements (Appendix B, Table 4, #14) are comparable to a celebrity's (Kaur et al. 2013) and she gives the product an "A" grade (Appendix, Table 4, #4). The one aspect that Jaclyn Hill (2016) does not mention is the cost of the product (Kaur et al. 2013), which advertisements typically share.

Although YouTube beauty tutorials are claimed to be personal reviews full of personal opinions to be shared with viewers and subscribers in a relatively intimate digital format, they

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

are comparable to an advertisement in terms of structure and content. Therefore, their content can be further analyzed and compared to the specifics and goals of an advertisement.

6.2 RQ2 Trust and Truth

The reviewer's attempts to promote trust across the videos aligned with one another, and they used tactics referred to by Herman and Chomsky (1988) in their "Propaganda Model" and Bernays (1935) in his "Public Relations Program". NikkieTutorials (2016), Manny Mua (2016), and Jaclyn Hill (2016) got the message across that their positive reviews of the product were truthful, despite being sent the products for free, by creating a sense of honesty, expertise, leadership, and friendliness. After establishing themselves as embodying these characteristics, the gurus use their status as trustworthy and truthful reviewers to dispel any negative opinions that viewers may have about the brand or product.

Throughout the three videos all of the reviewers made continuous attempts to gain the trust of their viewers. This was done through their explicit requests for trust from their viewers and frequently emphasizing their own honesty. For example, NikkieTutorials (2016) used the terms: "trust me" (Appendix B, Table 5, #5), "honestly," and "I'm not gonna lie" (Appendix B, Table 5, #6); Manny Mua (2016) used: "honestly" and "honest opinion" (Appendix B, Table 5, #6); and Jaclyn Hill said: "honestly," "honest," "no reason to lie," and "not gonna lie" (Appendix B, Table 5, #6). Additionally, the disclaimers at the beginning of each video are used to establish an overall sense of trust (Appendix B, Table 4, # 1). By being honest that they had received the products for free and by addressing ethical concerns through reassurance that their review would not be influenced (Appendix B, Table 5, #3), the reviewers protected their integrity while framing themselves as open and honest. In addition, all three reviewers expressed shock and

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

surprise about their having been sent the products for free (Appendix B, Table 5, #4). However, all of the gurus still reviewed the product despite their claims that they were gifts without direct expectations from the company that they would post a review in exchange.

The fact that each of the reviewers discussed the products, despite being sent them for free, aligns with the third step of the “Propaganda Model” and frames them as experts. Herman and Chomsky (1988) explain that the media rely “on information provided by [. . .] ‘experts’ funded and approved by these primary sources and agents of power” (Herman and Chomsky p. 2). Therefore, although the reviewers chose to review the products, they are considered “experts” who are being supported by Kylie Cosmetics, a major agent of power in the cosmetics world. In addition, viewers may deem the reviewers to be trustworthy or legitimate “experts” because of their being reputable enough to be sent free items from corporations in the first place. Of course, those endowed with the persona of the “expert” are not necessarily experts; rather, those in power are “shaping” and supplying material support to those who they want to appear as trustworthy (Herman and Chomsky p. 23). This tactic is used to “manage” and “manipulate” the coverage of a given product, service, or situation (Herman and Chomsky p. 23). In this case, it is used to frame Kylie Cosmetics’ Eyeshadow Palettes as positive by flooding YouTube with positive video reviews from popular and seemingly honest reviewers. The multiple reviews then make the prevailing positive consensus appear as the truth, making it difficult to label these “experts” as “liars” (Herman and Chomsky 1988 p. 22).

The reviewers’ reputations and assumed positions of leadership also allow them to create a sense of trust, resulting in the ability to get the appropriate message across. Lee and Watkins (2016) note that trust is connected to widely recognized people. NikkieTutorials is widely

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

recognized with over 7.5 million subscribers, Manny Mua with over 3 million, and Jaclyn Hill with over 4 million. Therefore their followers reinforce their expertise, which qualifies them as “experts” and makes their YouTube videos a medium through which to spread Kylie Cosmetics’ messages, for instance, in a way that will be well received and trusted. As Bernays (1935) notes in the third step of the “Public Relations Program,” in order to promote a product well, the industry must analyze the public opinion, change the attitude if needed, and “endeavor to educate the public to its own point of view” (p. 85-86). Each reviewer does this throughout their videos by establishing a sense of trust, followed by addressing any negative opinions that the audience may have toward the brand and hence the product. Once this is complete, they dispel any negativity by promoting the new product as “better” by comparison, from a position of trustworthiness.

In connection to this, NikkieTutorials (2016) specifically states, “Now, of course, when you are positive about Kylie Jenner a lot of people think you’re being bought, or you sold your soul, or that you’re being sponsored. Now trust me, Kylie has not sponsored any of my videos” (see Appendix B, Table 5, #3). Here, NikkieTutorials (2016) completes both of the goals outlined by Bernays (1935), since she addresses the skeptical attitude toward online reviews as well as the corporate power of Kylie Jenner’s products. In addition, once she has established trust, NikkieTutorials (2016) attempts to alter the opinions of those who may have been unhappy with Kylie Cosmetics products in the past, by stating, “Now let me tell you about the Bronze Palette [. . .] I wasn’t a huge fan of that palette, now this one however hu-buh-bah” (Appendix B, Table 4, #5).

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

Manny Mua (2016) also addresses any viewers who may have a negative opinion towards the review since the product was sent to him for free. As he states, “even though the product was sent to me, the palette was sent to me, I’m not going to like say, ‘oh my God it was so amazing because it was sent to me,’ no that’s not how I work” (Appendix B, Table 5, #3). He follows this with, “If I like the palette I like it, if I don’t then I don’t and that’s just what it is. There’s nothing wrong with having a different opinion” (Appendix B, Table 5, #3). Furthermore, he addresses those who may have a negative opinion towards the Kylie Cosmetics brand, and tries to change their opinion by arguing that the new palette is better than the previously released Bronze Palette. This is an attempt to regain the support of those who may have been disappointed with the brand in the past. He states, “So I’m impressed with this palette. Much more that I am impressed with the last one. I feel like she picked it up and it’s just better. That’s just what it is. It’s better. It’s actually worth the price this time and the other one I just didn’t think it was. So that is just my honest opinion” (Appendix B, Table 4, #5).

Jaelyn Hill (2016) also addresses any skeptical viewers, while trying to dispel past disappointment harboured by consumers who may have a negative opinion towards the product or brand. She states, “I will be totally honest with you guys about this as I always have been, as I was honest about her liquid lipsticks when they first came out, so I just got to put that disclaimer out there: no one is paying me” (Appendix B, Table 4, #5). It is clear that she tries to dispel reasons for skepticism by noting that she is not being paid. In addition, like the other two reviewers, she compares this review to a past “honest” review that she did in which she was not impressed with Kylie Cosmetics. However, in reference to this palette she notes “Oh yes. Kylie, honey, I’m a little impressed not gonna lie” (Appendix B, Table 4, #8).

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

Through an established sense of honesty, positions of expertise, leadership status, and playing the role of a genuine and trustworthy reviewer through past product comparisons, it is evident that corporations use beauty gurus to spread positive messages about a brand and product to the public by offering advice that is accepted as truth.

6.3 RQ3 Bias and Democracy

YouTube is used by influential YouTube beauty leaders as a democratic platform to reach and promote positive bias about cosmetics to a vast audience of subscribers from the appropriate target market, as well as those searching for reviews of the specific product based on keyword searches. This section will explore why and how biased messages are transmitted by gurus through the use of positive language. This will be followed by an exploration of how YouTube as a democratic platform allows for biased messages to be blurred and disguised.

Before delving into how biased messages are transmitted by gurus, one must understand why. Herman and Chomsky (1988) note that the third step of the “Propaganda Model,” “the reliance of the media on information provided by government, business, and ‘experts’ funded and approved by these primary sources and agents of power,” results in bias (p. 2). They state that “the media may feel obligated to carry extremely dubious stories and mute criticism in order not to offend their sources and disturb a close relationship” (Herman and Chomsky p. 22). Therefore, gurus may feel that they must review a product positively to maintain the relationship they have with their sponsors and sources of free items. In the third step of the “Public Relations Program,” Bernays (1935) indicates that selecting the correct medium to transmit a message positively is essential. In order to achieve this goal, sending a guru a product for free will presumably encourage them to give a biased opinion, and hence transmit a positive message, since they

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

would like to receive more products in the future. Therefore, in an attempt to be considered for more free goods, NikkieTutorials (2016), Manny Mua (2016), and Jaclyn Hill (2016) want to be deemed a positive and trusted source by Kylie Cosmetics. As a result, transmitting positive (and biased) messages in order to influence the audiences' opinion in a subtle manner, is done in the three video reviews through the use of language that is predominantly positive.

In order to influence the audiences' opinion in a subtle manner, biased opinions are promoted throughout NikkieTutorials' (2016) video review through the use of language. NikkieTutorials (2016) uses language to describe the product positively, such as: "love," "obsessed," "pigmented," "like a dream," "such ease," "insane," "crazy," "stunning," "beautiful," "sultry," "velvety," "impressed," "easy to work with," and "cool" (see Appendix B, Table 6, #2). When describing aspects of the product that the reviewer was less-pleased with, she used less-positive language. For example, to indicate that a shimmer eyeshadow did not meet the reviewer's expectations she stated, "I expected [. . .]" (see Appendix B, Table 6, #3). In regard to the same eyeshadow, the reviewer noted that it was "weird" and that she could not explain the consistency of the shadow (see Appendix B, Table 4, #14). But, rather than completely blaming the product's quality, she claimed that it needed "more love" when applying and that it was "stunning" once applied (see Appendix B, Table 6, #5; Appendix B, Table 6, #1). This was an indication of potential bias, since she did not directly voice her concerns. Instead, she used positive language to frame the makeup artist as having to make more of an effort to apply the product with "love," rather than noting that the product needed to be improved. In addition, following less-positive language with positive language was another tactic used, and it was an indication of bias. For example, she states, "OK it has a little bit of fall out, but that colour

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

though” and “I mean the shimmers do need a little bit more love when applying them but the matte, can we talk about the mattes” (see Appendix B, Table 6, #5 ; Appendix B, Table 6, #1).

Manny Mua (2016) also uses biased language to influence the audiences’ opinion. Manny Mua (2016) described the product using positive language such as: “cute,” “stunning,” “love,” “innovative,” “fucking cool,” “unique,” “beautiful,” “feels fucking good,” “really like this,” “lightweight,” “fucking bomb,” “blended fantastically,” “very nice,” “a win,” “that is a go,” “so pigmented,” “extremely soft,” and “extremely smooth” (Appendix B, Table 6, #2). When describing a colour, Naked, that did not have much colour pay-off or shimmer, Manny Mua (2016) used less positive language like, “it’s not my favourite,” however he followed this by saying that he thought that the colour was meant to be this way. He states, “It’s not like shimmery, [. . .] It’s not my favourite thing, but I believe that she did create this shadow in mind of people that wanted just a very lightweight like light shadow on the lid.” (Appendix B, Table 6, #3). To avoid saying anything deliberately negative about the product’s performance he notes that he thinks the colour is supposed to be less-pigmented, and therefore is performing as expected (Appendix B, Table 6, #6). While describing the same shadow, Naked, Manny Mua (2016) did use negative language by claiming that he did not like the shade (Appendix B, Table 6, #4), but he related this critique to personal preference, and still described the colour with a positive word, “beautiful” (Appendix B, Table 6, #3). He states, “For me personally I just know I’ll never use it so it’s like, oh it’s annoying to me. But it is a beautiful colour, it’s just not my cup of tea” (Appendix B, Table 6, #6). Blaming his critiques on personal preference was a tactic that Manny Mua (2016) used throughout the video, and it was an indication of bias.

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

Jaclyn Hill (2016) demonstrates the promotion of bias through language. To describe different aspects of the palette and its performance Jaclyn Hill (2016) used positive words such as: “pretty,” “modern and edgy,” “blending so well,” “they’re not choppy, they’re not streaky, they’re not patchy,” “impressed,” “nice pigment,” “nice colour payoff,” and “picks up nicely” (Appendix B, Table 6, #2). Overall, she gave the palette an “A” rating and the packaging an “A+” rating (Appendix B, Table 6, #2). In addition to this she notes, “the packaging itself slays my soul. Like when I saw Kylie’s Snapchat of this I didn’t even care what was inside this box” (Appendix B, Table 6, #16). Like the other two reviewers, when describing aspects of the product that she did not like, she attributed the product’s lack of effectiveness to the application process, and also cited personal preference. For example, when a shimmer shadow did not show up on her eyelid she states, “When I tried to apply it over my matte eyeshadow it did not work, but honestly I was stupid for even trying to do that in the first place. I know better than that” (Appendix B, Table 6, #5). When commenting on the shimmer being less-pigmented she referred to personal preference, stating, “I will say for me, personally I wish that these shimmers had more of a pop, more like a metallic-ness to it, but that’s because I’m secretly a drag queen inside” (Appendix B, Table 6, #6).

Although the reviews appear to be influenced by bias, YouTube’s reputation as an open or democratic platform, which allows users the freedom to create and post user generated content based on opinion, allows for the blurring of bias and opinion. Furthermore, the reviewers also encourage the audience to participate and interact with them, which highlights the democratic aspects of the platform.

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

NikkieTutorials (2016) actually invites her audience to participate in the reviewing process by encouraging them to leave their thoughts regarding the video review and/or the product in the comments section of the YouTube video. She states, “please let me know what you think of the Kylie Jenner Burgundy Palette down below in the comments” (Appendix B, Table 6, #7). She also encourages her viewers to subscribe to her channel, to rate the video positively if they enjoyed it, and to follow her on other social media platforms (Appendix B, Table 6, #7). NikkieTutorials (2016) also appeals to the use of YouTube as a democratic platform that allows her the freedom to express her own opinion. As she notes, “I do want to just claim that makeup is a personal game, something may work for you and it may not work for me” and “Makeup is all about a personal experience and please don’t judge me on mine” (Appendix B, Table 6, #7). These comments are an attempt to eliminate negative comments or reviews by using language of self-love and non-judgment, discouraging viewers from leaving feedback that may disagree with her “personal experience” and that might highlight the bias throughout the video.

Manny Mua (2016) encourages his viewers to subscribe to his channel and interact with the review positively by giving it a thumbs up (Appendix B, Table 6, #7). In addition, he notes that all of the links to his social media platforms are posted in the video description, as well as the palette link for those who would like to purchase it (Appendix B, Table 6, #7). However, Manny Mua (2016) attempts to limit negative viewers’ democratic freedom by encouraging those who do not like the video or him not to watch the video (Appendix B, Table 6, #7). This also promotes potential bias by eliminating the audience that may hold an opposing negative view. This is done through the use of negative language towards those who perceive the video in a way that diminishes the promotion of the product, as he states, “if you guys don’t like this video, if

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

you guys don't like me, please don't fucking watch it" (Appendix B, Table 6, #7).

Jaclyn Hill (2016) highlights that her entire video is based on a democratic approach, because she did the review by request: "I am doing this video by request" (Appendix B, Table 6, #7). She explains that she asked her audience if they wanted her to do a review on the palette and received an overwhelming positive response (Appendix B, Table 6, #7). She also emphasizes that people demonstrated their freedom to participate in large numbers across multiple social media accounts, so much so that her social media platform, Snapchat, crashed (Appendix B, Table 6, #7). Creating a review claiming that people asked for the video then diminishes the idea that the review contains bias or is comparable to an advertisement with financial gain.

Bias, spread through the use of language, and YouTube as a democratic platform, which allows for further bias disguised as opinion and the promotion of audience participation, are two features that work in combination to successfully transmit positive messages about these beauty products. Throughout their reviews, each reviewer used the tactic of following less-positive or negative aspects with a positive point, while also using self-blame and personal preference, which highlighted their use of bias. The reviewers also placed emphasis on YouTube as a democratic platform in order to further promote their bias as opinion.

7. Conclusion

This examination of reviews of the Kylie Cosmetics Kyshadow Palette on YouTube has demonstrated that YouTube video reviews rely on many of the same persuasive techniques as conventional online advertisements and that YouTube reviews reflect the contemporary evolution of advertising in a world where connectivity, transparency, and authenticity are becoming increasingly valuable commodities. In addition, it is evident that these advertisements are effective due to their implementation of Herman and Chomsky's (1988) and Bernays' (1935) methods of marketing and advertising. These methods are implemented on YouTube as an alternative communication platform to persuade viewers to align their opinions with those desired by the corporations who send the reviewers free products, the ultimate goal being product endorsement and awareness. This is done by creating an advertisement that is disguised as a review by a well-established "trustworthy" and "truthful" expert. In addition, the presence of these "amateur" videos on a democratic or open platform like YouTube helps create the appearance that the reviews are free of bias in favour of the brand.

Even if reviewers claim not to be creating an advertisement or intentionally endorsing a product, by simply accepting the free product and reviewing it they assist the corporation in working towards its communication goals, as the product gains exposure to the appropriate target market. Therefore, the review still benefits the corporation. This is what makes the method so original and effective, because ostensibly the reviewers are simply everyday people whose opinions and videos appear unmotivated, despite the mass attention and power that these reviewers have accrued.

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

From its original goal of being an online platform for hosting “user-generated content,” to becoming a Google-owned corporation with “professionally generated content,” as YouTube has become institutionalized so do its videos (Kim, 2012, p. 53). Indeed, their influence and reach continues to expand. This study on emerging marketing techniques on YouTube is relevant across many disciplines, such as communication, marketing and advertising, technology, and other related areas. Moving forward, this study could be expanded to include different types of video endorsements and advertisements on YouTube. For instance, reviews from those who are affiliated with a brand and are fully aware of their deliberate intentions to promote the product, whether they are sponsored, paid, and/or are receiving compensation other than being sent a free product. In addition, YouTube’s “sponsored videos” feature, which includes “Promoted Videos” and “Featured Videos” (Kim, 2012, p. 57), would be an interesting topic for further research.

Why is this study important? Because it speaks to emerging ways internet users are seeking out and finding “the truth” about the world around them. Quandt (2012) explains that online users “expect such open, seemingly uncontrolled online spaces to be more authentic, giving them direct access to information and revealing ‘truth’” (p. 6). In other words, whether or not they realize it, beauty gurus have a massive impact on public opinion, and in turn, the beauty industry. By bringing this influence and its impacts to the attention of both reviewers themselves and their audiences, reviewers can hopefully understand the importance of their responsibility to tell the truth and to be as unbiased as possible. In response, viewers will be granted the ability to make better informed decisions about what products they purchase, and about what claims – and truths – they believe.

Appendix A

NikkieTutorials (2016) Transcription

“Hey guys today I’m doing a review slash tutorial on the new Kylie Jenner Burgundy Palette. This recently came out and knowing Kylie Jenner it’s probably blowing up the internet, but this is what this gorgeous little creature looks like.

Now, personally before I start off, this got sent to my mom’s home address, and every Kylie product I’ve talked about in the past before I have bought with my own money and got sent to this place, right here, where I live and I went to my mom’s place and she was like you have a package so I opened the package up and it turned out to be Kylie Jenner and I was like oh how did she get that address? Now I think it’s so cool that Kylie sent me her fall collection. Now of course when you are positive about Kylie Jenner a lot of people think you’re being bought, or you sold your soul, or that you’re being sponsored. Now trust me, Kylie has not sponsored any of my videos. She sells a bunch, she sells enough product without my support. So no, Kylie didn’t sponsor my last video, she isn’t sponsoring this one, and trust me with the FDC rules, I, it would be illegal for me not to tell you if this was sponsored, so let’s get that out of the way.

Now let me tell you about the bronze palette. The bronze palette wasn’t really my cup of tea. I love the colors, but my main issue with that palette was that the shimmers were really not kind of shimmery and the mattes I found that the more you blended them on your eye they all turned out to be the same colour, so I wasn’t a huge fan of that palette, now this one however huh-bah. I created this very grungy warm-toned smokey eyes for fall, and I must say I am really impressed with this palette. The palette looks like this and of course the tears have the colors in chrome of what’s inside. Now this is what the inside looks like. It comes with nine shadows,

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

which are 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 mattes and four shimmers, it still doesn't include a mirror although Kylie has said herself on her snapchat that the next palette will have a mirror, and honey for \$42, mirror. So yeah we have nine lush, cranberry, warm, fall, rich eyeshadows and I love these colours, especially that middle one I'm wearing on the inner corners of my lower lash line. Obsessed.

So yeah, without any further ado, lets hop right into the demo slash tutorial on this look right here using the palette so that you can see how the shadows look on my eyes, how I like them. I'll give you my feedback on every shade that I use. Let's just get comfortable and relax and let's enjoy this Kylie Jenner Burgundy Palette review. Alright the first thing before we do anything with this palette is prime because I want this to last all day long. This is my MAC software paint pot. The first colour I'm gonna go in with is Penny, and I'm just defining my crease with this. Now as we can see, the pigment on Penny is insane. I love the warm, I love that orange tone, but it still looks like a matte copper almost. It is crazy pigmented, it blends into the socket like a dream, with such ease. Obsessed with Penny.

Now I'm going to go into Brick, and defining my inner and outer corners for a halo smokey eye. Ok the pigment of the mattes is insane. I ran into a couple of problems with the mattes in the last palette. I just felt like once you blended everything together it all just kind of looked like the same colour, but this is pigmented, a velvety smooth, and it just, it's so easy to work with. And now I'm just going to smoke out and blend in the edges to give it a nice, smooth gradient and to make it sexy, and seductive for this halo smoky eye. And then I darkened the inner and outer corner of the eye even more using Almond. Honestly you guys, I am really impressed with the mattes. For the centre of the lid I'm going to go in with the colour Dubai. Ok,

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

ok yeah. Ok not. . . ok this isn't a bad shadow, I just feel like the consistency is very thin. It's almost as if the shadow is really thin. Like it takes a little bit more effort and pressure to get the pigmentation of the shimmer to work. And I mean once it's on it's stunning, I just feel like, it's, it's weird to explain, but it's a very thin type of eyeshadow. Also, I'm not gonna lie, I expected that colour to be a little more chromatic and extreme so what we're going to do is go over top with the bronze. The bronze is called LA and this is going right on the centre of Dubai. Ok that is a stunning colour, but again I feel like again, the shadow itself is a thin sha, it's so hard to explain. It's a thinner shadow but I mean once it's on it is absolutely stunning and beautiful I just feel like it's a, it's an odd texture for a shimmer eyeshadow because it's quite thin. For my lower lash line I'm going to go back into Brick and smoke that baby out. And for the inner portion of the lower lash line I'm going to be applying Burgundy. Oh my God this colour. Yes. Ok it has a little bit of fall out, but that colour though. Oh my God, it's fall in an eyeshadow. Ok, deepening the entire lower lash line using Almond again. And lastly I'm going to highlight my inner corners using Naked. Ok. Ok I know a lot of people are not the biggest fan of this colour, but I think paired up with all of the beautiful warm tones, this on the inner corners makes it so sultry and different. I mean yes it's too dark for my skin tone but somehow I don't mind it. Weirdly enough though the texture and formula, that feels way different than the other shimmers I used. So this one feels a little bit more dense, a little bit more easy to work with, and it just glides on easier.

To finish off the look I'll be applying some falsies. These are Lilly Lashes in the style Tease. Alright so eyes done, cheeks almost done, I think we still need a bunch of glow for this look because doesn't matter if it's fall, winter, spring, summer, we need to glow. I'm gonna go in with my current favourite highlighter which is by Morphe. It's a pressed pigment and it's in the

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

colour Champagne Nights, and it's just, oh it's everything. So I am just gonna, woooo, blind. And we can't forget about the tip of the nose, you either love it or hate it, I guess we know which team I'm on. And to finish off this look I think it will only be fitting if I apply a Kylie Lip Kit colour. Dirty Peach, Dirty Peach, or mmmm, I can't choose I love em both. Let's do Moon to make it super super fall like. Alright just like that. Now we're gonna do a little spritz of setting spray to lock this into place, and we call it a day.

And that guys is how the Kylie Jenner Burgundy Palette works on the eyes. I overall think it's a really, really cool palette. I mean the shimmers do need a little bit more love when applying them but the matte, can we talk about the mattes. The mattes are absolutely insane, they're smooth, buttery, pigmented and they are so easy to work with. I am really, really impressed with these mattes.

My absolute favourite shade of the entire palette is Penny it is just so rich, and the ability to make it look like a matte copper is insane to me. I love it so much. So um yeah for me the Kylie Jenner Burgundy Palette gets a huge yes. I highly recommend it. It is a pricey palette, it is \$42 but I do think it's worth it.

As always, I do want to just claim that makeup is a personal game, something may work for you and it may not work for me. Makeup is all about a personal experience and please don't judge me on mine. So that's it guys, please let me know what you think of the Kylie Jenner Burgundy Palette down below in the comments. Don't forget to follow me on Twitter, Instagram, Facebook, and Snapchat. That all is NikkieTutorials. If you enjoyed watching this video then please don't forget to give it a thumbs up and subscribe to my channel. I want to thank you so much for watching again, and hopefully I will see you guys on the next one. Bye-bye."

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

Manny Mua (2016) Transcription

“Hey guys, welcome back to my channel. So as you can see, today’s video is going to be a review of the new Kylie Cosmetics, Kyshadow palette in the Burgundy Shade, the Burgundy Palette, aka. I was so ecstatic when I realized that this was sent to me. I had no, no idea I was gonna get a PR package with the Burgundy Palette and the new liquid lipsticks. I was actually a little shook because I didn’t order them. They were just sent to where I get my products sent to, and I was like, how did this even get here? No idea how it, I still to this day, I never got an e-mail from Kylie Cosmetics or anything. It was just sent to my house and honestly, I’m not complaining at all, that is fucking cool. But yes, even though the product was sent to me, the palette was sent to me, I’m not going to like say, ‘oh my God it was so amazing because it was sent to me’, no that’s not how I work, that’s just not what it is at all. If I like the palette I like it, if I don’t then I don’t and that’s just what it is. There’s nothing wrong with having a different opinion. Opinions are like assholes, everyone has one, not all of them are pretty, let’s be fucking real. But yeah, as always if you guys don’t like this video, if you guys don’t like me, please don’t fucking watch it, you know the drill with that. I say it in every single video, you know the fucking drill by now, come on now. But if you guys like this video please give it a thumbs up and subscribe if you aren’t already subscribed to my channel, and if you’re new, what’s up? I’m Manny MUA and thank you so much for being here!

I am going to be reviewing the new Burgundy Palette by Kylie Cosmetics. So it comes in that really really cool packaging like it did last time. This is the cute little box, the Kyshadow pressed powder eyeshadow palette. As you can see this is a rose gold finish on the outer packaging this time. And then this one is same aspect to the last palette as well, except this one

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

has more of a rose tone that drips to it, which is absolutely stunning and I love it. Just like last time I loved the packaging, I thought it was so innovative and so cool and so unique and I love that she differentiated this palette with the last one by doing the different coloured foil drips.

To open up the palette, same thing, exact same component as the last Kylie palette. Nine shades, no mirror in the palette, I wish it did have it. This retails for \$42. I'm gonna let you guys know whether or not I think this palette is worth the price or not, dun dun dunnn, is it worth it?

Ok first shade first, this is the shade Naked. I'm swatching it on my finger, it feels very, very, very soft and lightweight. I'm gonna swatch it on my hand. See that? So basically it is a very, very, very lightweight shimmer. This is actually not my favourite shade in the entire bunch. Actually, this is actually probably my least favourite shade in the entire bunch. It's a very just lightweight, tan shimmer colour. It's not like shimmery, where it's like BAM shimmer, it's like a light, subtle like sheen to the look. It's not my favourite thing, but I believe that she did create this shadow in mind of people that wanted just a very lightweight like light shadow on the lid. Which totally makes sense. For me personally I just know I'll never use it so it's like, oh it's annoying to me. But it is a beautiful colour, it's just not my cup of tea.

Cool? ok cool. So next shadow is going to be the shade Beach which is a beautiful orange-y tan, brown shade right here. Just swatch it with my hand, I feel it, oo it feels fucking good. I'm gonna swatch it with my finger right here, beautiful. It is beautiful, oh my gosh. I really, really like this shade so much, just not patchiness in this, for me there's no patchiness. As you can see, you can see there's no streaks in my hand it's a straight-up swatch, no streaks. It is in my crease and it looked great, it blended fantastically, so I really have no complaints. Is a very nice burnt orange, tan colour and that is a win for me. That is a go, that is a go honey. Next shade

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

is the shade Penny, and this is a very rustic orange shade. So, so pretty to go right into orange. We'll swatch it over here, COME ON! So pigmented! Oh my goodness, the shadows are extremely smooth, extremely soft. I feel like the mattes in this one are better than the mattes in the last palette because again they are smoother, they are softer, they have less kickback and I really, really like that this shade Penny is a win for me. This is also in my crease right now, it's like the orange shade you guys see in my crease. I love a nice rusty orange, red tone, especially cause it's matte so I love that.

Next we have this shade LA which is this really pretty copper, bronze shade. I'm gonna swatch it. This one feels so fucking good. Look at this, look at this fucking shade. This is a foiled finish which you guys know I'm screaming for. It's oh, oh my gay [inaudible- BJ way?]. Look up, that is a beautiful colour. This is actually the colour I'm wearing on my lid right now, I used it with a, a brush, I didn't even use it with my fingers and it was, it's this pigmented. So I'm very, very, very much impressed. That is my shit. I love that shade so, so, so much. So far the only colour that I do not like is Naked, so that's one of the four. Every other colour so far has been a go. So next is the shade Burgundy which is a very pretty pink. It's actually literally like a pink raspberry, you guys see? Beautiful, beautiful raspberry pink shade. It's not Burgundy to me whatsoever it's like a pink raspberry. I really feel like Kylie picked it up in this FORMULA! I'm impressed Kylie, fucking praise. So that shade of Burgundy is another go it's absolutely beautiful, it feels a very creamy and it doesn't pick up powder like the other shades work, so I definitely do think that this palette is already so much better than the last palette. The last one I did like, I just didn't think was worth the money, but so far this one is actually worth the money to me. So we just swatched five of the shadows so let's see the other four and see how they play

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

out. So now here is the shade Dubai. Feeling it with my finger, another beautiful foiled feeling, fucking gorgeousness. So what it looks like, I would say this shade is like a very pretty foiled rose shade. It has like an, a little bit of pink reflect, a little bit of gold reflect, so it's like a rose gold. But much more rose than gold. So I would say another banger. This is a beautiful shade, I really wanted to put this on all over my lid but the golden one was really just speaking to me, so I had to use the fucking gold you know. I just like the shimmers in this palette so much more, SO MUCH MORE than the last palette. Like these shimmers are actually like, shimmery and intense, the other ones weren't as intense for me and I love intense bold reflection.

Next shade is a shade of Brick and this is another matte shade. This is a really pretty red and brown, this is much more brown though. This reminds me of Swiss Chocolate by MAC. I'm gonna swatch it right next to Dubai. That's a fucking horrible swatch, let me try that again. Let's try that again mother fucker. So this is what the shade looks like right here. It's a very pretty, reddened, brown, again very similar to MAC Swiss Chocolate. It's literally like the same fucking colour to me it's hilarious. I actually have it on the outer corner of my eyes today, to blend in with that really pretty Penny shade. It just looks so, mmm so nice. And I feel like they blended so well. The shadows here, the mattes are much softer than the last one, which I feel is just odd because usually when it's softer there's more kickback, but there's less kickback in this palette than there was the last one. I don't know, I don't know how she did it, it's fucking bomb. Next shade is the shade New York and this is a, what is this? Feeling it, oo this feels like a fucking, just fucking good, feels fucking good. Let's go and swatch it right here. You guys see that, right there. Beautiful. This is a true taupe-y bronze shade. Much more foiled than the other palette is. It's not as intense, it's not as shiny as those other colours are, but it is another beautiful shade. It's

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

a really pretty deep bronze gold. Can you guys see that? It's like an old gold. So pretty. Another banger though. I do think this is a really pretty colour. I wanted to put this all over my lid as well but I only have one lid, I can't put that many colours on my lid because there's only one. New York is another go. I don't know why I'm saying that's a go, but it's just my thing today. And last but not least this is the shade Almond and this is a really pretty dark, dark, dark, very plumish brown. It reminds me A LOT of Aphrodite from my palette. Swatch it on this hand right here. Beautiful, deepened, plumish brown. So pretty! Very, very, very soft, lightweight matte shade. It's not intense by any means. It doesn't feel bad, it doesn't feel gross. It's a very soft feeling, which I really, really enjoy. It's funny because Almond and Brick are actually really, really similar. They're only off by a couple of tones. Like they're very, very, very, very similar.

Almond on the the outer corner of my eye to deepen everything. I don't have any black or different shadows on my crease or anything like that to make it deep. It was just using Almond and it really did work to make it look nice and dark and intense and had a lot of depth to the look, so again, Almond is another banger. I think that it turned out beautifully. And this is the final look using the Kylie Cosmetics Burgundy Palette.

Obviously I'm wearing lashes right now and I have liner on and I added a little bit of highlight to the inner corner and to the brow bone because the shadow Naked in this palette is not my favourite. The lashes I'm wearing actually in today's video are Miami by Lily Lashes if you guys are curious what lashes I'm wearing. Lily Lashes, Miami, you can use the code mannymua to save some money if you guys are interested in it. I just like this pair pair a lot they're very wispy and intense and they're so glam.

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

So again, all in all this palette retails for \$42. Do I think it's worth the price? I do! This is actually a good palette, I really do like this one and I know I'll actually be using this a lot more often than I was gonna use the other palette. The only shadow I don't like is the shade Naked and that's just not my cup of tea. I don't like shades like that, I don't like a very soft, like almost not there shimmer. I want either matte or I want intense shine, I don't want any in between. That's just my personal preference though. But I do think that this palette is actually worth the \$42 bucks, unlike last time I didn't think it was worth it. But this one I think is. Look at it, it's just so it's so pretty. These are the kind of tones I love. These are so beautiful to me. This is like my fucking bread and butter. This right now on my eye, bread and butter. That's my fucking bread and butter. I do think it is worth the price and I would buy this personally. I was gonna buy it, it just happened to be sent to me.

So I'm impressed with this palette. Much more that I am impressed with the last one. I feel like she picked it up and it's just better. That's just what it is. It's better. It's actually worth the price this time and the other one I just didn't think it was. So that is just my honest opinion. And yeah you guys! That is it for the entire video. I hope you guys enjoyed watching today's video of this Kylie cosmetics Burgundy Palette shadow review. I had so much fun creating this for you guys. Hope you guys enjoyed it, watching it as well. It was so much fun to film. As always I'm gonna leave all my social media links down below, my Snapchat, Twitter, Facebook, Instagram, everything will be linked down below as well as the palette, if I can find it or if it's even in stock still. But yeah, I thank you guys so much for watching, have a great rest of the night or day where you guys are and I will catch you guys in my next video. Bye you guys. Muah."

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

Jaclyn Hill (2016) Transcription:

“Hey guys so for today’s video, this is the most random video that I have filmed in a really long time. I’m going to be doing a first impressions video on the new Kylie cosmetics Kyshadow, ahh catch that one, very clever, huh? The Kyshadow Bronze Eyeshadow Palette. This is so random and unexpected, I was not planning on doing this. I’ve actually had such a busy day and it is currently 8:00, almost 8:30. 8:28 right now, and I decided to take a quick body shower and run over here and film this video for you guys because I received this package in the mail today.

This was sent to me from Kylie Cosmetics just so you guys know. Um, I received this package in the mail and I jumped on Snapchat and showed you guys some like finger swatches and showed you the packaging and the palette and all that jazz. And I asked you guys if you would like to see me use this in a video or do a first impressions, and I’m not kidding, I had so many snaps requesting it that my snap literally froze and shut down. I went to Twitter and I swear the tweets were coming in so fast, I could barely read them just from people asking to do a first impression and I just wanna say thank you because I mentioned recently that I was being in kind of a rut, I haven’t been feeling inspired, but I am taking action to make changes in areas so that I can help get myself out that. But honestly you guys just seeing you so excited over an eyeshadow palette has really just made me so happy and you guys have just kind of like, relit my excitement right now for makeup. And that’s why I’m here right now. I am just like, so happy to be doing this right now. I’m so appreciative and thankful for you guys and your excitement for makeup in general. So I’m just happy to be here.

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

The first thing I want to say about this though is the same thing that I saw on Snapchat and on Twitter a couple of nights ago, is the packaging itself slays my soul. Like when I saw Kylie's snapchat of this I didn't even care what was inside this box, when I saw this I was like 'UGH' [screams]. Oh God. Can you imagine if I open it up and they're all shattered? I would die. I just think it is so cool and different, and can we talk about this? like can we talk about this? This comes whenever you order the palette this comes in there with a little note on the back and I like, I can't. So this is what the palette itself looks like right here you can kind of get an idea for the size. It's like very small and compact, it's cardboard, very extremely light weight, and on the back it has the shades right there, it has her signature. I think this is like the coolest concept right here. It's like so simple but yet it's like very modern and edgy. Come on this is like, of course. We all saw this, we were all like yes, perfect. I have swatched this one, this one, this one, these matte shades right here on my hand I showed you guys on Snapchat. I will say the swatches are very, very promising, but again that's just a finger swatch so we will see how it actually goes on the eyes.

I'm going to be completely and totally honest in this video. I have absolutely no reason to lie to you guys. I never have and I never will. The day that I start lying to you guys for any reason is the day that my mom will bend me over her knee and spank me, and shut my channel down. I will be totally honest with you guys about this as I always have been, as I was honest about her liquid lipsticks when they first came out, so I just got to put that disclaimer out there no one is paying me. I did receive these, um this palette for free from Kylie Cosmetics. I just got it today. I am doing this video by request and that's all that I have to say. Let's get started.

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

I don't know if I have already mentioned but I do have my entire face of foundation concealer and powder, so my base is already completed, done so we're just going to go ahead and jump right into the eyes. And the first colour I'm going to pick up is this one right here a warm, medium, matte brown. I would compare this to something along the lines of like MAC Saddle. I'm going to pick it up on a fluffy natural hair brush, and let's see how this applies guys. I'm like anxious and excited to see how these apply. Im gonna just go ahead and put this right in the crease. Oh my gosh, so far so good you guys. I'm liking what I am seeing. I am going to zoom you in more so that you can really see what I'm doing. AH DON'T BE SCARED.

Now that I have less product on the brush I'm going to bring it all the way into the inner corner because I am going to cover my entire lid with product today, so I'll just lightly feather it in there. Applying just like any other shadow that I like applies. Like it's applying similar to makeup geek shadow, it's applying similar to MAC shadow, which I have to say on a different note I feel like MAC shadows have kind of gone down recently. Like is that just me because I've started using more and more brands like my standards have gotten higher but I feel like MAC shadows used to be better, especially the shimmers, I don't know why. But anyways, not important, ok so now I'm going to pick up this shade right above it which is a definitely a little bit more of a cool tone, has a little bit more of a grey undertone in it. I'm going to be using the exact same brush, and this is the Morphe M441 by the way. I'm going to go right over top of that now just a little bit higher up in the crease, but right over top of it. This colour is applying beautifully. I mean, since the first one applied beautifully I'm sure all the mattes will, but you never know because sometimes in some palettes there's a lot of inconsistency, like one matte will be gorgeous and then the next one, right next to it won't like blend, you know what I'm saying?

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

Alright, now I'm gonna pick up the middle shade, oh it's just so pretty, and that is in the shade citrine, sigh-trine, sitrine? [trying to pronounce] like citron, citron, citrine? haha oh God, I'm such an idiot. I'm going to take like a less amount of it and I'm just basically going to like take my brush and then go like this and just like dab a little bit of in it, dab a little bit in it haha, just so I have like a little amount of the product on the tip of my brush and then I'm gonna very lightly, with a more light hand, go over that whole area just to give it that warmth and brightness that an orange shadow does. Oh yes. Kylie, honey, I'm a little impressed not gonna lie.

Alright, I'm just gonna pick up a smaller blending brush it basically looks the exact same but just a little bit smaller and this is the Morphe M433 and I'm going to go back in with that original colour right here, and I'm just going to put a little bit on the brush and I'm now just gonna press this kind of on my lid, just like a light sweep. Just to get that colour because I want this to basically be a matte look. Honestly you guys these shadows are blending so well. I mean you can see it on camera, you know like you can't fake it. You can see how well they're blending. They're not choppy, they're not streaky, they're not patchy, I'm really impressed right now.

Now I'm gonna grab this shadow all the way down here, and this is Obsidian. Ok how come all these names are things that I have no idea how to pronounce. Like I need to go back to school. And this is a really pretty, medium toned, very warm rich reddish brown. It reminds me of like a MAC Swiss Chocolate. So this one, as I swirl my brush in this one, it did have more pickup than the others, right here, but I will say that I know just from other stuff that um I'm working on, that reds are typically like that. If you ever swatch a shadow that has a lot of red pigment in it, and it kicks up a ton of shadow, it's really, really tricky to develop red under toned

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

eyeshadows. So it does have a lot of kickback compared to the other ones. I'm going to go ahead and put this out here and this has nice pigment too. I'm going to pick up a little more because I don't want fallout. Yeah, this has really nice pigment for a reddish shadow, cause again, it's really hard to get good pigmentation when you're working with red shades. I know a lot of times in palettes I'll be so excited about the red colour, I like the cranberry colour and then when you actually go to use it, it is like absolutely no pigment in it. It's just very tricky to develop red. I will say this one is not applying as easily as the others, the others were so, um, like worry-free and so easy, this one I'm having to kind of press it in a little bit more, but again, that's probably because of the red. It has a little bit more fallout but still, this is nothing that I would like complain about, this is just very standard to me, you know this is the same as any other eyeshadow brand.

So now for this part I am going to just bake my under eye really quick because I am going to go in with the darker shades and I just don't want like any of it to like fall out, like the dark brown and the black to fall out and like mess up my foundation. So I'm gonna grab some translucent powder and a damp beauty sponge. If you do your foundation first and then you wanna go in with dark eyeshadows and you're scared that you're going to get it all over your face this is just a way to make sure that you do not ruin your concealer and foundation because you can just sweep all the product away and you're good to go. I mean you look like a freak while you're doing it but whatever.

Alright so now I'm gonna grab the middle shadow on the bottom and this is in the shade Bronzite and this again is matte. So far we've only worked with the matte shades. And what brush I want to use for this...I'm gonna sit with the same, exact brush that I've been using and

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

I'm going to pack this on, ooo this is nice pigment. I'm going to pack this on using just a tiny bit right on the lash line area and then just ever so slightly put it in the outer corner of my eye. I don't want this to be too intense so I'm gonna keep it kind of light for this part you know what I'm going to do, I'm actually going to take like just a small angle brush like this one right here, I'm gonna dip it in a translucent powder and I'm going to carve out, I don't know if you guys ever seen me do this before but this is a great trick if you want like a slanted, cattish type eye but you don't wanna use tape or you have on foundation already, and I'm just going to stamp it on there just like this and then it will make it so that when we wipe it away you have just like an immediate cat eye.

I'm going to go back and I'm going to grab a little bit of these two shades and mix them together just a little bit of that warm brown and that orangey. I'm gonna put a tiny bit of that warm on my brush, not too much. I'm gonna blend out this harsh line right here, on the edge, just with tiny, little wiggling motions. Now as you can see I'm slightly um, getting rid of my translucent powder. That's ok, you won't have to worry about that, you can go back in and grab a little bit more of it and just put it right over top of that line and let it sit and it will just continue to erase anything that you bring down there. Alright now I'm going to grab a pencil brush and a pencil brush will do, and then I'm going to go in with the black shade right here, and this one looks like it's going to be super black. I'm going to take this and I'm going to run it right along my lash line. I am just dipping my brush like one dab into the black because I don't want to get tons and tons of fallout, so when I pick up the black I'm literally going like boop, like one thing and then tapping off the excess. You can see the pigment that it gives.

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

Ok, so at this point I have used almost all the matte shades, except I have not used this one just because I personally am not a like matte, white, vanilla, cream kind of girl. I know that tons of people are, which is why everyone puts it in their palettes, but I'm not. Um, for the purpose of this video I'm going to go in with a shimmer colour, but typically I would just leave it like this and put on some lashes and mascara and complete my brows and all that jazz, but I'm going to use one of the shimmers so that we can see how they apply and I don't know which one I want, I'm going to do this one. It picks up nicely like when I'm, when I'm grabbing it with my brush like it seems to pick up nice. It doesn't have, like it doesn't get chunky or anything so I'm just going to go ahead and apply it right in here, in the inner corner. Ok, so I'm not getting much of anything on my eyes but I actually thought about this when I was applying the matte shadow beforehand, because most of the time when you apply a matte shadow before a shimmer shadow you don't get any colour payoff and I thought about that as I was applying the matte shadow. Like if this was on just regular, bare skin I wonder if it'd be different. So what I'm going to do is I'm going to like prime the back of my hand really quick and I'm going to apply it to my hand to see if it applies better because it might be because of the fact that I just put a matte shadow down and then shimmers don't work. I'm going to apply the exact same shadow that I just tried to apply on my lid. I feel like I didn't give it like a fair chance. I don't want to say that it's terrible before I try this. So this is Tigereye, again the same one that I used on my eyelid. I'm gonna pick up the same amount on my brush right there and let's see if we apply it like this, ok, see now look. Now we're getting pigment like it's supposed to have.

Let me grab the other eyeshadow. Wipe off my brush. I'm going to grab the other shimmer and try. Ok see, so they are showing up on my hand with a brush, perfectly fine, so I'm

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

gonna just say that the reason that it's not showing up on my lid is because the fact that I used a matte shadow first, I'm going to go back over with just a little bit more black eyeshadow cause I just want this look to be smoky. You know I figure if we're doing a first impression video of eyeshadow like we get to do something dark and smoky and really see what these shadows can do, right? Alright, I'm just grabbing a brush and wiping away my under-eye area to get rid of all that bake-age and now you can see what that translucent powder did for my eyes, how it made it like a nice slant right there. See how it just cleans it up and gives you a cat eye. It's a really nice tip, you can see it right there. I'm just gonna make this a little bit sharper. I just looked over in that mirror and I was like, wait a second, this looked a little unblended, if you ask me.

Ok I'm going to grab the middle shade right here, and the very top, it's another shimmer and it's in the shade Quartz, I'm going to attempt to highlight my brow bone with this because I don't know if it's gonna be too dark, so let's try this one. I don't know, we'll find out. Oh ya, no it works, ok, cool. It's working. I'm going over it with Jasper, which is the light, creamy matte shade. I'm gonna pop on a new pair of lashes, I have not tried yet and they are fluff and Dolled Up, so by velour lashes. OH MY GOD, Dolled Up! I used to wear those back in the day! But these are like the new, silk version of them.

Alright so now I have my lashes on and I'm so mad at myself, when I was applying mascara I got it right here, like a huge glob, and then I had to get rid of it and I smudged my eyeshadow, and on my eyeshadow it looks like it's all like unblended, ugh this is my nightmare. This is my actual nightmare.

Alright I'm gonna grab a pencil brush, this is like an old pencil brush from Sedona Lace, from like years ago and I'm going to grab this shade right here, the warm kind of caramel brown

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

shade and I'm going to just put that right on my lower lashline. Now I'm gonna take this reddish, brown shade in the far corner and I'm gonna put that right over top. Am I the only person who doesn't really look at themselves like when they do this, like they just feel for it and just look around the room. I'm gonna pick up a small definer brush like this right here and I'm gonna dip it into the black. I'm gonna put that just on the outer of my lower lashline. I'm trying so hard not to make my face where i'm like ... always do when I apply shadow on my lower lashline. Uh, I almost made it, see that I stopped myself. I stopped myself real quick. I'm going to apply some MAC Costa Riche eye pencil in my waterline because I think my waterline looks a little bare. Alright so, I just threw on some makeup obviously to finish off my look, but I figured you guys don't want to see that because this video is about this bad boy right here right?

Uh, so I will say that my overall take away from this palette is that if you are looking for everyday, neutral basic palette, it just applies easily, you're not looking for anything that's too metallic, you're not looking for anything that's too difficult or too bright or intense, this would be the palette for you. It is a great everyday like girl-next-door palette. I will say for me, personally I wish that these shimmers had more of a pop, more like a metallic-ness to it, but that's because I'm secretly a drag queen inside. I always apply my shimmers with MAC Fix+ or unless they're like a really intense, already metallic like foiled shadow I'll, if I go with a shimmer I want it to be shimmer like I don't want a subtle shimmer, I want like glitter, you know? Um, but someone like my sister who just loves like that everyday look, like she would love these shimmers, because they have a nice colour payoff but they're just very subtle.

When I tried to apply it over my matte eyeshadow it did not work, but honestly I was stupid for even trying to do that in the first place. I know better than that. But when I primed my

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

hand and put it on my hand with the brush they were beautiful. So I honestly though think that that's kind of how she intended it because of the fact that there are so many more mattes. There's only two shimmers in the nine colour so I have a feeling that she didn't want these to be very vibrant and intense obviously because she made them a little bit more subtle as opposed to like a really intense like metallic, creamy, shimmery eyeshadow, you know?

Overall I would give this palette an A for sure. I would give the packaging an A+, this is sick nasty. I love the packaging so much. If I was Kylie I would blow this image up like gigantic, like the size of a wall and like put it above my couch, or my bed or something cause I think it is just so cool. Anyways I'm gonna stop rambling. Thank you so much for watching this video you guys, I really hope that you enjoyed. I love you, thank you so much for requesting this and I will see you in my next video, muah, bye.”

Appendix B

The data analysis for each category and their corresponding codes are included in Tables 4, 5, and 6. The coded data related to the theme advertising is indicated in Table 4. The coded data related to the theme trust and truth is indicated in Table 5. The coded data related to the theme bias and democracy is indicated in Table 6.

Table 4: RQ1 Advertising Data Analysis

Category Name: Advertising	NikkieTutorials	Manny MUA	Jaclyn Hill
1 Disclaimer	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “this got sent to my mom’s home address, and every Kylie product I’ve talked about in the past before I have bought with my own money” • “Kylie has not sponsored any of my videos.” • “So no, Kylie didn’t sponsor my last video, she isn’t sponsoring this one [. . .] it would be illegal for me not to tell you if this was sponsored” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “this was sent to me.” • “But yes, even though the product was sent to me, the palette was sent to me, I’m not going to like say, ‘oh my God it was so amazing because it was sent to me’, no that’s not how I work, that’s just not what it is at all.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “This was sent to me from Kylie cosmetics just so you guys know.” • “I just got to put that disclaimer out there no one is paying me. I did receive these, um this palette for free from Kylie Cosmetics.”
2 Public Figure	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “knowing Kylie Jenner it’s probably blowing up the internet” • “Kylie Jenner [. . .] sells enough product without my support” • “Don’t forget to follow me on Twitter, Instagram, Facebook, and Snapchat. That all is NikkieTutorials.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “subscribe if you aren’t already subscribed to my channel, and if you’re new, what’s up? I’m Manny MUA and thank you so much for being here!” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “I had so many snaps requesting it that my snap literally froze and shut down. I went to Twitter and I swear the tweets were coming in so fast, I could barely read them just from people asking to do a first impression” • “I’m so appreciative and thankful for you guys and your excitement for makeup in general. So I’m just happy to be here.” • “it has her [Kylie Jenner’s] signature”

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

<p>3 Self Promotion</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Don’t forget to follow me on Twitter, Instagram, Facebook, and Snapchat. That all is NikkieTutorials. If you enjoyed watching this video then please don’t forget to give it a thumbs up and subscribe to my channel.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “if you guys like this video please give it a thumbs up and subscribe if you aren’t already subscribed to my channel, and if you’re new, what’s up? I’m Manny MUA and thank you so much for being here!” • “It reminds me A LOT of Aphrodite from my palette” • “The lashes I’m wearing actually in today’s video are Miami by Lily Lashes if you guys are curious what lashes I’m wearing. Lily Lashes, Miami, you can use the code mannymua to save some money if you guys are interested in it.” • “As always I’m gunna leave all my social media links down below, my Snapchat, Twitter, Facebook, Instagram, everything will be linked down below” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “I will say that I know just from other stuff that um I’m working on, that reds are typically like that.”
<p>4 Product Endorsement</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “I overall think it’s a really, really cool palette” • “So um yeah for me the Kylie Jenner Burgundy Palette gets a huge yes. I highly recommend it.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Do I think it’s worth the price? I do! This is actually a good palette, I really do like this one” • “I do think that this palette is actually worth the \$42 bucks” • “I do think it is worth the price and I would buy this personally.” • “So I’m impressed with this palette.” • “everything will be linked down below as well as the palette” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “If you are looking for everyday, neutral basic palette, it just applies easily, you’re not looking for anything that’s too metallic, you’re not looking for anything that’s too difficult or too bright or intense, this would be the palette for you” • “Overall I would give this palette an A for sure. I would give the packaging an A+”

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

<p>5 Product and Brand History</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Now let me tell you about the Bronze Palette. The Bronze Palette wasn’t really my cup of tea. I love the colors, but my main issue with that palette was that the shimmers were really not kind of shimmery and the mattes I found that the more you blended them on your eye they all turned out to be the same colour, so I wasn’t a huge fan of that palette” • “I ran into a couple of problems with the mattes in the last palette.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “So it comes in that really really cool packaging like it did last time. [. . .]And then this one is same aspect to the last palette as well” • “the mattes in this one are better than the mattes in the last palette” • “so much better than the last palette.” • “I really feel like Kylie picked it up in this FORMULA! I’m impressed Kylie, fucking praise.” • “I just like the shimmers in this palette so much more, SO MUCH MORE than the last palette. [. . .] the other ones weren’t as intense for me and I love intense bold reflection” • “the mattes are much softer than the last one” • “So I’m impressed with this palette. Much more than I am impressed with the last one. I feel like she picked it up and it’s just better. That’s just what it is. It’s better. It’s actually worth the price this time and the other one I just didn’t think it was. So that is just my honest opinion” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “I was honest about her liquid lipsticks when they first came out”
<p>6 Product Information</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “new Kylie Jenner Burgundy Palette. This recently came out” • “Now this is what the inside looks like. It comes with nine shadows, which are 1,2,3,4,5 mattes and four shimmers, it still doesn’t include a mirror” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “I am going to be reviewing the new Burgundy Palette by Kylie Cosmetics. [. . .] the Kyshadow pressed powder eyeshadow palette.” • “Nine shades, no mirror in the palette, I wish it did have it.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “I’m going to be doing a first impressions video on the new Kylie cosmetics Kyshadow [. . .] The Kyshadow Bronze eyeshadow palette.” • “It’s like very small and compact, it’s cardboard, very extremely light weight, and on the back it has the shades right there, it has her signature.”

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

7 Product Price	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• “honey for \$42, mirror.”• “It is a pricey palette, it is \$42 but I do think it’s worth it”	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• “This retails for \$42.”• “So again, all in all this palette retails for \$42.”• “this palette is actually worth the \$42 bucks”	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• N/A
-----------------	---	--	---

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

<p>8 Product Effectiveness</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “The bronze palette wasn’t really my cup of tea. I love the colors, but my main issue with that palette was that the shimmers were really not kind of shimmery and the mattes I found that the more you blended them on your eye they all turned out to be the same colour, so I wasn’t a huge fan of that palette, now this one however huh-buh-bah.” • “The first colour I’m gonna go in with is Penny, and I’m just defining my crease with this. Now as we can see, the pigment on Penny is insane. I love the warm, I love that orange tone, but it still looks like a matte copper almost. It is crazy pigmented, it blends into the socket like a dream, with such ease. Obsessed with Penny.” • “Now I’m going to go into Brick, and defining my inner and outer corners for a halo smokey eye. Ok the pigment of the mattes is insane. I ran into a couple of problems with the mattes in the last palette. I just felt like once you blended everything together it all just kind of looked like the same colour, but this [Brick] is pigmented, a velvety smooth, and it just, it’s so easy to work with.” • “Honestly you guys, I am really impressed with the mattes.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “[Naked is] a very just lightweight, tan shimmer colour. It’s not like shimmery, where it’s like BAM shimmer, it’s like a light, subtle like sheen to the look.” • “[Beach] feels fucking good. [. . .] for me there’s no patchiness. As you can see, you can see there’s no streaks in my hand it’s a straight-up swatch, no streaks. It is in my crease and it looked great, it blended fantastically” • “[Penny] COME ON! So pigmented! Oh my goodness, the shadows are extremely smooth, extremely soft. I feel like the mattes in this one are better than the mattes in the last palette because again they are smoother, they are softer, they have less kickback” • “[LA] I used it with a brush, I didn’t even use it with my fingers and it was, it’s this pigmented. So I’m very, very, very much impressed.” • “So next is the shade Burgundy [. . .] It’s not Burgundy to me whatsoever it’s like a pink raspberry. I really feel like Kylie picked it up in this FORMULA! I’m impressed Kylie, fucking praise. [. . .] it feels a very creamy and it doesn’t kickup powder like the other shades work, so I definitely do think that this palette is already so much better than the last palette.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Oh my gosh, so far so good you guys. I’m liking what I am seeing.” • “Applying just like any other shadow that I like applies. Like it’s applying similar to Makeup Geek shadow, it’s applying similar to MAC shadow” • “This colour is applying beautifully. [. . .] since the first one applied beautifully I’m sure all the mattes will” • “[Citrine] Oh yes. Kylie, honey, I’m a little impressed not gunna lie.” • “Honestly you guys these shadows are blending so well. They’re not choppy, they’re not streaky, they’re not patchy, I’m really impressed right now.” • “It reminds me of like a MAC Swiss Chocolate. So this one, as I swirl my brush in this one, it did have more pickup than the others, [. . .] So it does have a lot of kickback compared to the other ones. [. . .] I’m going to go ahead and put this out here and this has nice pigment too. I’m going to pick up a little more because I don’t want fallout. Yeah, this has really nice pigment for a reddish shadow, I will say this one is not applying as easily as the others, the others were so, um, like worry-free and so easy, this one I’m having to kind of press it in a little bit more, but again, that’s probably because of the red. It has a little bit more fallout”
--------------------------------	--	--	---

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “the colour Dubai. Ok, ok yeah. Ok not. . . ok this isn’t a bad shadow, I just feel like the consistency is very thin. It’s almost as if the shadow is really thin. Like it takes a little bit more effort and pressure to get the pigmentation of the shimmer to work. and I mean once its on it’s stunning, I just feel like, it’s, it’s weird to explain, but it’s a very thin type of eyeshadow. Also, I’m not gonna lie, I expected that colour to be a little more chromatic and extreme” • “Ok that [LA] is a stunning colour, but again I feel like again, the shadow itself is a thin sha, it’s so hard to explain. It’s a thinner shadow [. . .] it’s an odd texture for a shimmer eyeshadow because it’s quite thin.” • “Oh my God this colour [Burgundy]. Yes. Ok it has a little bit of fall out, but that colour though.” • “So this one [Naked] feels a little bit more dense a little bit more easy to work with, and it just glides on easier.” • “And that guys is how the Kylie Jenner Burgundy Palette works on the eyes. I overall think it’s a really, really cool palette. I mean the shimmers do need a little bit more love when applying them but the matte, can we talk about the mattes. The mattes are absolutely insane, they’re smooth, buttery, pigmented and they are so easy to work with. I am really, really impressed with these mattes.” • “something may work for you and it may not work for me.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “[Dubai] another beautiful foiled feeling, fucking gorgeousness. So what it looks like, I would say this is shade is like a very pretty foiled rose shade. It has like an, a little bit of pink reflect, a little bit of gold reflect, so it’s like a rose gold.” • “I just like the shimmers in this palette so much more, SO MUCH MORE than the last palette. Like these shimmers are actually like, shimmery and intense.” • “[Brick] reminds me of Swiss Chocolate by MAC. [. . .] That’s a fucking horrible swatch, let me try that again. [. . .] blended so well. The shadows here, the mattes are much softer than the last one, [. . .] there’s less kickback in this palette than there was the last one. I don’t know, I don’t know how she did it, it’s fucking bomb.” • “New York. This is a true taupey bronze shade. [. . .] It’s not as intense, it’s not as shiny as those other colours are” • “[Almond] Very, very, very soft, lightweight matte shade. It’s not intense by any means. It doesn’t feel bad, it doesn’t feel gross.” • “Do I think it’s worth the price? I do! This is actually a good palette” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “This colour is applying beautifully. I mean, since the first one applied beautifully I’m sure all the mattes will” • “I am just dipping my brush like one dab into the black because I don’t want to get tons and tons of fallout [. . .] You can see the pigment that it gives.” • “[shimmer shadow] It picks up nicely [. . .]. Ok, so I’m not getting much of anything on my eyes but I actually thought about this when I was applying the matte shadow beforehand, because most of the time when you apply a matte shadow before a shimmer shadow you don’t get any colour payoff [. . .]. So this is Tigereye, again the same one that I used on my eyelid. I’m gunna pick up the same amount on my brush right there and let’s see if we apply it like this, ok, see now look. Now we’re getting pigment like it’s supposed to have. Ok see, so they are showing up on my hand with a brush, perfectly fine” • “my overall take away from this palette is that if you are looking for everyday, neutral basic palette, applies easily” • “they have a nice colour payoff but they’re just very subtle.”
--	--	---	--

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

9 Bandwagon	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• “This recently came out and knowing Kylie Jenner it’s probably blowing up the internet” (1)• “Ok I know a lot of people are not the biggest fan of this colour” (18)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• “everything will be linked down below as well as the palette, if I can find it or if it’s even in stock still.” (18)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• “And I asked you guys if you would like to see me use this in a video or do a first impressions, and I’m not kidding, I had so many snaps requesting it that my snap literally froze and shut down. I went to Twitter and I swear the tweets were coming in so fast, I could barely read them just from people asking to do a first impression” (2)• “The first thing I want to say about this though is the same thing that I saw on Snapchat and on Twitter a couple of nights ago, is the packaging itself slays my soul.” (16)
-------------	---	---	---

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

Table 5: RQ2 Trust and Truth Data Analysis

Category Name: Trust and Truth	NikkieTutorials	Manny MUA	Jaclyn Hill
1 Personal Experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “personally [. . .] every Kylie product I’ve talked about in the past before I have bought with my own money” • “I ran into a couple of problems with the mattes in the last palette.” • “Ok I know a lot of people are not the biggest fan of this colour, but I think paired up with all of the beautiful warm tones, this on the inner corners makes it so sultry and different. I mean yes it’s too dark for my skin tone but somehow I don’t mind it.” • “I do want to just claim that makeup is a personal game, something may work for you and it may not work for me.” (21) • “Makeup is all about a personal experience and please don’t judge me on mine.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “For me personally I just know I’ll never use it so it’s like, oh it’s annoying to me.” • “I really really like this shade so much, just no patchiness in this, for me there’s no patchiness.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Applying just like any other shadow that I like applies. Like it’s applying similar to makeup geek shadow, it’s applying similar to MAC shadow” • “So this one, as I swirl my brush in this one, it did have more pickup than the others, right here, but I will say that I know just from other stuff that um I’m working on, that reds are typically like that. [. . .] it’s really really tricky to develop red undertoned eyeshadows.”
2 The Law	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “So no, Kylie didn’t sponsor my last video, she isn’t sponsoring this one, and trust me with the FTC rules, I, it would be illegal for me not to tell you if this was sponsored” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • N/A 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • N/A

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

<p>3 Addressing Ethical Concerns</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Now, personally before I start off, this got sent to my mom’s home address, and every Kylie product I’ve talked about in the past before I have bought with my own money and got sent to this place right here where I live” • • “Now of course when you are positive about Kylie Jenner lot of people think you’re being bought, or you sold your soul, or that you’re being sponsored. Now trust me, Kylie has not sponsored any of my videos. She sells a bunch, she sells enough product without my support.” • • “So no, Kylie didn’t sponsor my last video, she isn’t sponsoring this one, and trust me with the FTC rules, I, it would be illegal for me not to tell you if this was sponsored, so let’s get that out of the way.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “But yes, even though the product was sent to me, the palette was sent to me, I’m not going to like say, ‘oh my God it was so amazing because it was sent to me’, no that’s not how I work, that’s just not what it is at all” • • “I do think it is worth the price and I would buy this personally. I was gunna buy it, it just happened to be sent to me.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “I’m going to be completely and totally honest in this video. I have absolutely no reason to lie to you guys. I never have and I never will. The day that I start lying to you guys for any reason is the day that my mom will bend me over her knee and spank me, and shut my channel down. I will be totally honest with you guys about this as I always have been, as I was honest about her liquid lipsticks when they first came out, so I just got to put that disclaimer out there no one is paying me. I did receive these, um this palette for free from Kylie Cosmetics. I just got it today. I am doing this video by request and that’s all that I have to say. Let’s get started.”
<p>4 Naivety</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “I went to my mom’s place and she was like, ‘you have a package’ so I opened the package up and it turned out to be Kylie Jenner and I was like ‘oh how did she get that address?’ Now I think it’s so cool that Kylie sent me her fall collection.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “I was so ecstatic when I realized that this was sent to me. I had no, no idea I was gunna get a PR package with the Burgundy Palette and the new liquid lipsticks. I was actually a little shook because I didn’t order them. They were just sent to where I get my products sent to, and I was like, how did this even get here? No idea how it, I still to this day, I never got an e-mail from Kylie Cosmetics or anything. It was just sent to my house and honestly, I’m not complaining at all, that is fucking cool.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I’m going to be doing a first impressions video on the new Kylie cosmetics Kyshadow [. . .] The Kyshadow Bronze eyeshadow palette. This is so random and unexpected, I was not planning on doing this. [. . .] I decided to [. . .] run over here and film this video for you guys because I received this package in the mail today. This was sent to me from Kylie cosmetics just so you guys know.”

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

<p>5 Convinced Trust</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Now trust me, Kylie has not sponsored any of my videos. She sells a bunch, she sells enough product without my support.” • “Trust me with the FTC rules, I, it would be illegal for me not to tell you if this was sponsored.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “But yes, even though the product was sent to me, the palette was sent to me, I’m not going to like say, ‘oh my God it was so amazing because it was sent to me’, no that’s not how I work, that’s just not what it is at all.” • “I would buy this personally. I was gonna buy it, it just happened to be sent to me. “ 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “I have absolutely no reason to lie to you guys. I never have and I never will. The day that I start lying to you guys for any reason is the day that my mom will bend me over her knee and spank me, and shut my channel down I will be totally honest with you guys about this as I always have been, as I was honest about her liquid lipsticks when they first came out, so I just got to put that disclaimer out there no one is paying me.”
<p>6 Honesty</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Honestly you guys, I am really impressed with the mattes” • “I’m not gonna lie, I expected that colour to be a little more chromatic and extreme” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “It was just sent to my house and honestly, I’m not complaining at all, that is fucking cool.” • “So that is just my honest opinion.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “honestly you guys just seeing you so excited over an eyeshadow palette has really just made me so happy” • “I’m going to be completely and totally honest in this video. I have absolutely no reason to lie to you guys. I never have and I never will. The day that I start lying to you guys for any reason is the day that my mom will bend me over her knee and spank me, and shut my channel down. I will be totally honest with you guys about this as I always have been, as I was honest about her liquid lipsticks when they first came out” • “Oh yes. Kylie, honey, I’m a little impressed not gonna lie.” • “Honestly you guys these shadows are blending so well.” • “but honestly I was stupid for even trying to do that in the first place.” • “So I honestly though think that that’s kind of how she intended it”

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

<p>7 Friendliness</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Hey guys today I’m doing a review/tutorial on the new Kylie Jenner Burgundy Palette.” • “Let’s just get comfortable and relax and let’s enjoy this Kylie Jenner Burgundy Palette review” • “I want to thank you so much for watching again, and hopefully I will see you guys on the next one. Bye-bye.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ““if you’re new, what’s up? I’m Manny MUA and thank you so much for being here!” • “I hope you guys enjoyed watching today’s video of this Kylie cosmetics Burgundy Palette shadow review. I had so much fun creating this for you guys. Hope you guys enjoyed it, watching it as well. It was so much fun to film” • “But yeah, I thank you guys so much for watching, have a great rest of the night or day where you guys are and I will catch you guys in my next video. Bye you guys. Muah” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “I just wanna say thank you [. . .] just seeing you so excited over an eyeshadow palette has really just made me so happy and you guys have just kind of like, relit my excitement right now for makeup. And thats why I’m here right now. I am just like, so happy to be doing this right now. I’m so appreciative and thankful for you guys and your excitement for makeup in general. So I’m just happy to be here.” • Thank you so much for watching this video you guys, I really hope that you enjoyed. I love you, thank you so much for requesting this and I will see you in my next video, muah, bye.”
-----------------------	---	--	--

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

<p>8 Inclusive Language</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “let’s get that out of the way.” • “Let’s hop right into the demo/tutorial on this look right here using the palette” • “Let’s just get comfortable and relax and let’s enjoy this Kylie Jenner Burgundy Palette review” • “All right the first thing before we do anything with this palette is prime” • “Now as we can see, the pigment on Penny is insane.” • “what we’re going to do is go over top with the bronze.” • “I think we still need a bunch of glow [. . .] we need to glow.” • “And we can’t forget about the tip of the nose, [. . .] I guess we know which team I’m on.” • “Now we’re gonna do a little spritz of setting spray to lock this into place, and we call it a day.” • “Can we talk about the mattes.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “let’s be fucking real.” • “We’ll swatch it over here” • “Next we have this shade LA” • “So we just swatched five of the shadows so let’s see the other four and see how they play out.” • “Let’s try that again mother fucker.” • “Let’s go and swatch it right here.” • “Next we have this shade LA” • “So we just swatched five of the shadows so let’s see the other four and see how they play out.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Let’s get started.” • “Let’s see how this applies guys.” • “Let’s see if we apply it like this, ok” • “Now we’re getting pigment like it’s supposed to have.” • “Let’s try this one. I don’t know, we’ll find out” • “can we talk about this? like can we talk about this?” • “We all saw this, we were all like yes, perfect.” • “we will see how it actually goes on the eyes.” • “we’re just going to go ahead and jump right into the eyes.” • “So far we’ve only worked with the matte shades.” • “but I’m going to use one of the shimmers so that we can see how they apply” • “let’s see if we apply it like this” • “You know I figure if we’re doing a first impression video [. . .] • “I don’t know, we’ll find out.”
-----------------------------	---	--	--

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

<p>9 Addressing the Audience</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Hey guys” • “it would be illegal for me not to tell you” • “Now let me tell you about the bronze palette” • “you can see how the shadows look on my eyes, [. . .] I’ll give you my feedback on every shade that I use.” • “Honestly you guys, I am really impressed with the mattes” • “And that guys is how the Kylie Jenner Burgundy Palette works on the eyes.” • “I do want to just claim that makeup is a personal game, something may work for you and it may not work for me.” • “please don’t judge me • “please let me know what you think” • “If you enjoyed watching this video then please don’t forget to give it a thumbs up and subscribe to my channel. I want to thank you so much for watching again, and hopefully I will see you guys on the next one. Bye-bye.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Hey guys” • “as you can see, today’s video is going to be a review” • “if you guys don’t like this video, if you guys don’t like me, please don’t fucking watch it, you know the drill with that. I say it in every single video, you know the fucking drill by now, come on now. But if you guys like this video please give it a thumbs up and subscribe if you aren’t already subscribed to my channel, and if you’re new, what’s up? I’m Manny MUA and thank you so much for being here!” • “it’s like the orange shade you guys see in my crease” • “This is a foiled finish which you guys know I’m screaming for.” • “It’s actually literally like a pink raspberry, you guys see?” • “You guys see that? Right there. Beautiful.” • “I hope you guys enjoyed watching today’s video [. . .] I thank you guys so much for watching, have a great rest of the night or day where you guys are and I will catch you guys in my next video. Bye you guys. Muah” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Hey guys” • “I decided to [. . .] run over here and film this video for you guys” • “just so you guys know.” • “I jumped on Snapchat and showed you guys some like finger swatches and showed you the packaging” • “But honestly you guys just seeing you so excited over an eyeshadow palette has really just made me so happy and you guys have [. . .]” • “Can you imagine if I open it up and they’re all shattered?” • “you can kind of get an idea for the size” • “no reason to lie to you guys [. . .]” • “let’s see how this applies guys.” • “I am going to zoom you in more so that you can really see” • “you know what I’m saying?” • “Honestly you guys these shadows are blending so well. [. . .] You can see how well they’re blending.” • “If you ever swatch a shadow that has a lot of red pigment in it [. . .]” • “If you do your foundation first [. . .]” • “I don’t know if you guys ever seen me do this” • “I figured you guys don’t want to see that [. . .] right?” • “Thank you so much for watching this video you guys”
----------------------------------	---	--	---

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

<p>10 Visual Proof</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “but this is what this gorgeous little creature looks like.” • “Now this is what the inside looks like.” • “you can see how the shadows look on my eyes” • “Now as we can see, the pigment on Penny is insane.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “As you can see” • “Look at this, look at this fucking shade” • “So this is what the shade looks like right here.” • “I’m gunna swatch it on my hand. See that?” • “As you can see, you can see there’s no streaks in my hand” • It’s actually literally like a pink raspberry, you guys see? • “let’s see the other four and see how they play out.” • “You guys see that, right there. Beautiful.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “So this is what the palette itself looks like” • “ok, see now look. Now we’re getting pigment like it’s supposed to have.” • “we will see how it actually goes on the eyes.” • “let’s see how this applies guys. [. . .] Oh my gosh, so far so good you guys. I’m liking what I am seeing. I am going to zoom you in more so that you can really see what I’m doing. AH DON’T BE SCARED.” • “Honestly you guys these shadows are blending so well. I mean you can see it on camera, you know like you can’t fake it. You can see how well they’re blending.” • “Now as you can see [. . .]” • “You can see the pigment that it gives.” • “I’m going to use one of the shimmers so that we can see how they apply” • “Ok see, so they are showing up on my hand with a brush, perfectly fine” • “do something dark and smoky and really see what these shadows can do, right?” • “now you can see what that translucent powder did for my eyes, [. . .] See how it just cleans it up and gives you a cat eye. It’s a really nice tip, you can see it right there.” • I almost made it, see that I stopped myself.
------------------------	---	--	--

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

<p>11 Opinion</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Now I think it’s so cool that Kylie sent me her fall collection.” • “The bronze palette wasn’t really my cup of tea.” • I must say I am really impressed with this palette. • “it still doesn’t include a mirror although Kylie has said herself on her snapchat that the next palette will have a mirror, and honey for \$42, mirror.” • “I love these colours” • “I know a lot of people are not the biggest fan of this colour, but I think paired up with all of the beautiful warm tones, this on the inner corners makes it so sultry and different. I mean yes it’s too dark for my skin tone but somehow I don’t mind it.” • “My absolute favourite shade of the entire palette is Penny it is just so rich, and the ability to make it look like a matte copper is insane to me. I love it so much.” • “So um yeah for me the Kylie Jenner Burgundy Palette gets a huge yes. I highly recommend it. It is a pricey palette, it is \$42 but I do think it’s worth it.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “If I like the palette I like it, if I don’t then and don’t [. . .]. There’s nothing wrong with having a different opinion.” • “Just like last time I loved the packaging, I thought it was so innovative and so cool and so unique” • “For me personally I just know I’ll never use it so it’s like, oh it’s annoying to me.” • “I really really like this shade so much, [. . .] for me there’s no patchiness.” • “I feel like the mattes in this one are better than the mattes in the last palette” • “I definitely do think that this palette is already so much better than the last palette.” • “I just like the shimmers in this palette so much more, [. . .] the other ones weren’t as intense for me and I love intense bold reflection” • “But I do think that this palette is actually worth the \$42 bucks, unlike last time I didn’t think it was worth it. But this one I think is.” • “These are the kind of tones I love. These are so beautiful to me. This is like my fukin bread and butter.” • “The only shadow I don’t like is the shade Naked and that’s just not my cup of tea. [. . .] That’s just my personal preference though.” • “It’s actually worth the price this time and the other one I just didn’t think it was. So that is just my honest opinion.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “I feel like MAC shadows have kind of gone down recently.” • “I’m a little impressed not gonna lie.” • “I have not used this one just because I personally am not a like matte, white, vanilla, cream kind of girl I know that tons of people are which is why everyone puts it in their palettes, but I’m not” • “It is a great everyday like girl-next-door palette. I will say for me, personally I wish that these shimmers had more of a pop, more like a metallicness to it, but that’s because I’m secretly a drag queen inside.”
-------------------	--	--	---

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

<p>12 Advice Giving</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “I’ll give you my feedback on every shade that I use.” • “So um yeah for me the Kylie Jenner Burgundy Palette gets a huge yes. I highly recommend it. It is a pricey palette, it is \$42 but I do think it’s worth it.” • “As always, I do want to just claim that makeup is a personal game, something may work for you and it may not work for me.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “I believe that she did create this shadow in mind of people that wanted just a very lightweight like light shadow on the lid.” • “The lashes I’m wearing actually in today’s video are Miami by Lily Lashes if you guys are curious what lashes I’m wearing. Lily Lashes, Miami, you can use the code mannymua to save some money if you guys are interested in it.” • “I do think it is worth the price and I would buy this personally. I was gunna buy it, it just happened to be sent to me.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “If you do your foundation first and then you wanna go in with dark eyeshadows and you’re scared that you’re going to get it all over your face this is just a way to make sure that you do not ruin your concealer and foundation” • “I’m gunna dip it in a translucent powder and I’m going to carve out, I don’t know if you guys ever seen me do this before but this is a great trick if you want like a slanted, catish type eye” • “most of the time when you apply a matte shadow before a shimmer shadow you don’t get any colour payoff” • “if you are looking for everyday, neutral basic palette, it just applies easily, you’re not looking for anything that’s too metallic, you’re not looking for anything that’s too difficult or too bright or intense, this would be the palette for you. It is a great everyday like girl-next-door palette.”
-------------------------	--	---	---

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

Table 6: RQ3 Bias and Democracy Data Analysis

Category Name: Bias and Democracy	NikkieTutorials	Manny MUA	Jaclyn Hill
1 Potential Bias	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “before I start off, this got sent to my mom’s home address” • “Now I think it’s so cool that Kylie sent me her fall collection. Now of course when you are positive about Kylie Jenner a lot of people think you’re being bought or you sold your soul or that you’re being sponsored.” • “Ok it has a little bit of fall out, but that colour” • “ok this isn’t a bad shadow, I just feel like the consistency is very thin. It’s almost as if the shadow is really thin. Like it takes a little bit more effort and pressure to get the pigmentation of the shimmer to work. and I mean once its on it’s stunning” • “I mean the shimmers do need a little bit more love when applying them but the matte, can we talk about the mattes. The mattes are absolutely insane, they’re smooth, buttery, pigmented and they are so easy to work with. I am really, really impressed with these mattes.” • “the Kylie Jenner Burgundy Palette gets a huge yes. I highly recommend it. It is a pricey palette, [. . .] but I do think it’s worth it.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “the product was sent to me, the palette was sent to me, I’m not going to like say, ‘oh my God it was so amazing because it was sent to me’, no that’s not how I work, that’s just not what it is at all.” • “It was just sent to my house and honestly, I’m not complaining at all, that is fucking cool” • “But yeah, as always if you guys don’t like this video, if you guys don’t like me, please don’t fucking watch it [. . .] But if you guys like this video please give it a thumbs up and subscribe if you aren’t already subscribed to my channel, and if you’re new, what’s up? I’m Manny MUA and thank you so much for being here!” • “It’s not my favourite thing, but I believe that she did create this shadow in mind of people that wanted just a very lightweight like light shadow on the lid. Which totally makes sense.” • “But I do think that this palette is actually worth the \$42 bucks, unlike last time I didn’t think it was worth it. But this one I think is. Look at it, it’s just so its so pretty.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “I did receive these, um this palette for free from Kylie Cosmetics.” • “Applying just like any other shadow that I like applies.” [But then says] “This colour is applying beautifully. I mean, since the first one applied beautifully I’m sure all the mattes will” • “Uh, so I will say that my overall take away from this palette is that if [. . .] you’re not looking for anything that’s too difficult or too bright or intense, this would be the palette for you. [. . .] I will say for me, personally I wish that these shimmers had more of a pop, more like a metallicness to it” • “When I tried to apply it over my matte eyeshadow it did not work, but honestly I was stupid for even trying to do that in the first place. I know better than that.”

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

<p>2 Positive Language</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “this is what this gorgeous little creature looks like.” • “really impressed with this palette.” • “I love these colours” • “the pigment on Penny is insane. I love the warm, I love that orange tone [. . .] It is crazy pigmented, it blends into the socket like a dream, with such ease. Obsessed with Penny.” • “the pigment of the mattes is insane. [. . .] this is pigmented, a velvety smooth, [. . .] so easy to work with.” • “really impressed with the mattes.” • “Ok that is a stunning colour” • “absolutely stunning and beautiful” • “[. . .] beautiful warm tones, [. . .] so sultry and different.” • “dense [. . .] easy to work with, and it just glides on easier.” • “it’s a really, really cool palette.” • “The mattes are absolutely insane, they’re smooth, buttery, pigmented and they are so easy to work with.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “I was so ecstatic when I realized that this was sent to me. [. . .] that is fucking cool.” • “really really cool packaging [. . .] This is the cute little box [. . .] absolutely stunning and I love it. [. . .] innovative and so cool and so unique” • “it feels very, very, very soft and lightweight” • “feels fucking good.” • “beautiful. It is beautiful, oh my gosh. I really really like this shade so much” • “it’s a straight-up swatch, no streaks. It is in my crease and it looked great, it blended fantastically, so I really have no complaints.” • “that is a win for me. That is a go, that is a go honey.” • “So, so pretty [. . .] COME ON! So pigmented! [. . .] the shadows are extremely smooth, extremely soft.” • “the mattes in this one are better than the mattes in the last palette [. . .] they are smoother, they are softer, they have less kickback and I really really like that this shade Penny is a win for me.” • “This one feels so fucking good. Look at this, look at this fucking shade. This is a foiled finish which you guys know I’m screaming for.” • “I’m very, very, very much impressed. That is my shit. I love that shade” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “the packaging itself slays my soul. [. . .] I just think it is so cool and different” • “It’s like so simple but yet it’s like very modern and edgy. [. . .] We all saw this, we were all like yes, perfect.” • “This colour is applying beautifully. I mean, since the first one applied beautifully I’m sure all the mattes will” • “oh it’s just so pretty” • “Oh yes. Kylie, honey, I’m a little impressed not gonna lie.” • “Honestly you guys these shadows are blending so well. [. . .] They’re not choppy, they’re not streaky, they’re not patchy, I’m really impressed right now.” • “Yeah, this has really nice pigment for a reddish shadow” • “ooo this is nice pigment.” • “It picks up nicely like when I’m, when I’m grabbing it with my brush like it seems to pick up nice. It doesn’t have, like it doesn’t get chunky or anything” • “they have a nice colour payoff but they’re just very subtle.”
----------------------------	--	---	---

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “My absolute favourite shade of the entire palette is Penny it is just so rich, and the ability to make it look like a matte copper is insane to me. I love it so much. So um yeah for me the Kylie Jenner Burgundy Palette gets a huge yes. I highly recommend it.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Kylie picked it up in this FORMULA! I’m impressed Kylie, fucking praise.” • “another go, it’s absolutely beautiful [. . .] creamy” • “this palette is already so much better than the last palette. [. . .] this one is actually worth the money to me.” • “I just like the shimmers in this palette so much more, SO MUCH MORE than the last palette. Like these shimmers are actually like, shimmery and intense, [. . .] I love intense bold reflection.” • “I don’t know how she did it, it’s fucking bomb.” • “So pretty! Very, very, very soft, lightweight matte shade. [. . .] It’s a very soft feeling” • “it really did work to make it look nice and dark and intense and add a lot of depth to the look, so again, Almond is another banger.” • “Do I think it’s worth the price? I do! This is actually a good palette, I really do like this one” • “These are the kind of tones I love. These are so beautiful to me. This is like my fucking bread and butter.” • “I’m impressed with this palette. [. . .] I feel like she picked it up and it’s just better. That’s just what it is. It’s better. It’s actually worth the price this time” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Overall I would give this palette an A for sure. I would give the packaging an A+, this is sick nasty. I love the packaging so much.”
--	--	---	--

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

<p>3 Less-Positive Language</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “The bronze palette wasn’t really my cup of tea. I love the colors, but my main issue with that palette was that the shimmers were really not kind of shimmery and the mattes I found that the more you blended them on your eye they all turned out to be the same colour, so I wasn’t a huge fan of that palette” • “it still doesn’t include a mirror [. . .] and honey for \$42, mirror” • “I ran into a couple of problems with the mattes in the last palette. [. . .] it all just kind of looked like the same colour” • “Ok, ok yeah. Ok not. . . ok this isn’t a bad shadow, I just feel like the consistency is very thin. It’s almost as if the shadow is really thin. Like it takes a little bit more effort and pressure to get the pigmentation of the shimmer to work. and I mean once its on it’s stunning, I just feel like, it’s, it’s weird to explain, but it’s a very thin type of eyeshadow. Also, I’m not gonna lie, I expected that colour to be a little more chromatic and extreme” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “no mirror in the palette, I wish it did have it.” • “This is actually not my favourite shade in the entire bunch. Actually, this is actually probably my least favourite shade in the entire bunch. It’s a very just lightweight, tan shimmer colour. It’s not like shimmery, where it’s like BAM shimmer, it’s like a light, subtle like sheen to the look. It’s not my favourite thing, but I believe that she did create this shadow in mind of people that wanted just a very lightweight like light shadow on the lid. Which totally makes sense. For me personally I just know I’ll never use it so it’s like, oh it’s annoying to me. But it is a beautiful colour, it’s just not my cup of tea.” • “So far the only colour that I do not like is Naked, so that’s one of the four.” • “The last one I did like, I just didn’t think was worth the money” • “It’s not as intense, it’s not as shiny” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Applying just like any other shadow that I like applies. [. . .] it’s applying similar to MAC shadow, which I have to say on a different note I feel like MAC shadows have kind of gone down recently. Like is that just me because I’ve started using more and more brands like my standards have gotten higher but I feel like MAC shadows used to be better, especially the shimmers, I don’t know why.” • “So this one, as I swirl my brush in this one, it did have more pickup than the others, right here, but I will say that I know just from other stuff that um I’m working on, that reds are typically like that. If you ever swatch a shadow that has a lot of red pigment in it, and it kicks up a ton of shadow, it’s really really tricky to develop red under toned eyeshadows. So it does have a lot of kickback compared to the other ones.” • “It’s just very tricky to develop red. I will say this one is not applying as easily as the others, the others were so, um, like worry-free and so easy, this one I’m having to kind of press it in a little bit more, but again, that’s probably because of the red. It has a little bit more fallout but still, this is nothing that I would like complain about, this is just very standard to me, you know this is the same as any other eyeshadow brand.”
---------------------------------	--	--	---

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Ok that is a stunning colour, but again I feel like again, the shadow itself is a thin sha, it’s so hard to explain. It’s a thinner shadow but I mean once it’s on it is absolutely stunning and beautiful I just feel like it’s a, it’s an odd texture for a shimmer eyeshadow because it’s quite thin.” • “Ok it has a little bit of fall out, but that colour though.” • “Ok I know a lot of people are not the biggest fan of this colour, [. . .] I mean yes it’s too dark for my skin tone but somehow I don’t mind it.” • “I mean the shimmers do need a little bit more love when applying them but the matte, can we talk about the mattes.” • “It is a pricey palette, it is \$42” 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “I have not used this one just because I personally am not a like matte, white, vanilla, cream kind of girl I know that tons of people are which is why everyone puts it in their palettes, but I’m not.” • “Ok, so I’m not getting much of anything on my eyes” • “I will say for me, personally I wish that these shimmers had more of a pop, more like a metallic-ness to it, [. . .] if I go with a shimmer I want it to be shimmer like I don’t want a subtle shimmer, I want like glitter, you know?” • “When I tried to apply it over my matte eyeshadow it did not work [. . .] I honestly though think that that’s kind of how she intended it because of the fact that there are so many more mattes. There’s only two shimmers in the nine colour so I have a feeling that she didn’t want these to be very vibrant and intense obviously because she made them a little bit more subtle as opposed to like a really intense like metallic, creamy, shimmery eyeshadow”
--	---	--	---

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

<p>4 Negative Language</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> N/A 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> “But yeah, as always if you guys don’t like this video, if you guys don’t like me, please don’t fucking watch it, you know the drill with that. I say it in every single video, you know the fucking drill by now, come on now.” “The only shadow I don’t like is the shade Naked and that’s just not my cup of tea. I don’t like shades like that, I don’t like a very soft, like almost not there shimmer. I want either matte or I want intense shine, I don’t want any in between.” “That’s a fucking horrible swatch, let me try that again.” “I do think that this palette is actually worth the \$42 bucks, unlike last time I didn’t think it was worth it” “It’s actually worth the price this time and the other one I just didn’t think it was.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> “I don’t want to say that it’s terrible before I try this.”
----------------------------	---	---	--

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

<p>5 Self-Blame</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “I mean the shimmers do need a little bit more love when applying” • “it takes a little bit more effort and pressure to get the pigmentation of the shimmer to work. and I mean once its on it’s stunning” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “That’s a fucking horrible swatch, let me try that again.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Ok, so I’m not getting much of anything on my eyes but I actually thought about this when I was applying the matte shadow beforehand, because most of the time when you apply a matte shadow before a shimmer shadow you don’t get any colour payoff and I thought about that as I was applying the matte shadow. Like if this was on just regular, bare skin I wonder if it’d be different. [. . .] it might be because of the fact that I just put a matte shadow down and then shimmers don’t work. I’m going to apply the exact same shadow that I just tried to apply on my lid. I feel like I didn’t give it like a fair chance. I don’t want to say that it’s terrible before I try this. [. . .] ok, see now look. Now we’re getting pigment like it’s supposed to have. [. . .] Ok see, so they are showing up on my hand with a brush, perfectly fine, so I’m gunna just say that the reason that it’s not showing up on my lid is because the fact that I used a matte shadow first” • “When I tried to apply it over my matte eyeshadow it did not work, but honestly I was stupid for even trying to do that in the first place. I know better than that.”
---------------------	---	---	---

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

<p>6 Personal Preferences</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “The bronze palette wasn’t really my cup of tea. [. . .] I wasn’t a huge fan of that palette, now this one however hu-buh-bah.” • “And we can’t forget about the tip of the nose, you either love it or hate it, I guess we know which team I’m on.” • “As always, I do want to just claim that makeup is a personal game, something may work for you and it may not work for me. Makeup is all about a personal experience and please don’t judge me on mine.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “This is actually not my favourite shade in the entire bunch. Actually, this is actually probably my least favourite shade in the entire bunch. It’s a very just lightweight, tan shimmer colour. It’s not like shimmery, where it’s like BAM shimmer, it’s like a light, subtle like sheen to the look. It’s not my favourite thing, but I believe that she did create this shadow in mind of people that wanted just a very lightweight like light shadow on the lid. Which totally makes sense. For me personally I just know I’ll never use it so it’s like, oh it’s annoying to me. But it is a beautiful colour, it’s just not my cup of tea.” • “I definitely do think that this palette is already so much better than the last palette. The last one I did like, I just didn’t think was worth the money, but so far this one is actually worth the money to me.” • “I just like the shimmers in this palette so much more, SO MUCH MORE than the last palette. Like these shimmers are actually like, shimmery and intense, the other ones weren’t as intense for me and I love intense bold reflection.” • “The only shadow I don’t like is the shade Naked and that’s just not my cup of tea. I don’t like shades like that, I don’t like a very soft, like almost not there shimmer. I want either matte or I want intense shine, I don’t want any in between. That’s just my personal preference though.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “I will say for me, personally I wish that these shimmers had more of a pop, more like a metallic-ness to it, but that’s because I’m secretly a drag queen inside. I always apply my shimmers with MAC Fix+ or unless they’re like a really intense, already metallic like foiled shadow I’ll, if I go with a shimmer I want it to be shimmer like I don’t want a subtle shimmer, I want like glitter, you know?”
-------------------------------	---	--	---

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

<p>7 Democracy</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Now of course when you are positive about Kylie Jenner a lot of people think you’re being bought or you sold your soul or that you’re being sponsored. Now trust me, Kylie has not sponsored any of my videos. She sells enough product without my support. So no, Kylie didn’t sponsor my last video, she isn’t sponsoring this one” • “I do want to just claim that makeup is a personal game, something may work for you and it may not work for me” • “Makeup is all about a personal experience and please don’t judge me on mine.” • “So that’s it guys, please let me know what you think of the Kylie Jenner Burgundy Palette down below in the comments.” • “Don’t forget to follow me on Twitter, Instagram, Facebook, and Snapchat. That all is NikkieTutorials. If you enjoyed watching this video then please don’t forget to give it a thumbs up and subscribe to my channel.” • “I want to thank you so much for watching again, and hopefully I will see you guys on the next one.” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “But yes, even though the product was sent to me, the palette was sent to me, I’m not going to like say, ‘oh my God it was so amazing because it was sent to me’, no that’s not how I work, that’s just not what it is at all. If I like the palette I like it, if I don’t then and don’t and that’s just what it is. There’s nothing wrong with having a different opinion.” • “But yeah, as always if you guys don’t like this video, if you guys don’t like me, please don’t fucking watch it, you know the drill with that. I say it in every single video, you know the fucking drill by now, come on now.” • “But if you guys like this video please give it a thumbs up and subscribe if you aren’t already subscribed to my channel, and if you’re new, what’s up? I’m Manny MUA and thank you so much for being here!” • “I had so much fun creating this for you guys. Hope you guys enjoyed it, watching it as well. It was so much fun to film. As always I’m gonna leave all my social media links down below, my Snapchat, Twitter, Facebook, Instagram, everything will be linked down below as well as the palette” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Hey guys so for today’s video, this is the most random video that I have filmed in a really long time. [. . .] This is so random and unexpected, I was not planning on doing this.” • “I asked you guys if you would like to see me use this in a video or do a first impressions, and I’m not kidding, I had so many snaps requesting it that my snap literally froze and shut down. I went to Twitter and I swear the tweets were coming in so fast, I could barely read them just from people asking to do a first impression” • “And thats why I’m here right now. I am just like, so happy to be doing this right now. I’m so appreciative and thankful for you guys and your excitement for makeup in general. So I’m just happy to be here.” • “I’m going to be completely and totally honest in this video. I have absolutely no reason to lie to you guys. I never have and I never will.” • “I am doing this video by request” • “thank you so much for requesting this”
--------------------	--	--	---

References

- Androulaki, G.R. (2015). *The leading role of influencers in the YouTube beauty community* (Master's Thesis). Retrieved from <http://1nu.diva-portal.org/smash/record.jsfpid=diva2%3A816476&dswid=-5222>
- Baudelaire, C., & Mayne, J. (1995). *The painter of modern life and other essays* (2nd ed.) Phaidon Press.
- Bernays, E. L. (1935). Molding public opinion. *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 179(1), 82-87. doi:10.1177/000271623517900111
- Federal Trade Commission. (2015). *The FTC's Endorsement Guidelines: What People Are Asking*. Retrieved from <https://www.ftc.gov/tips-advice/business-center/guidance/ftc-endorsement-guides-what-people-are-asking#how>
- Fisher, E. (2015). 'You media': Audiencing as marketing in social media. *Media, Culture & Society*, 37(1), 50-67. doi:10.1177/0163443714549088
- Herman, E. S., & Chomsky N. (1988). Manufacturing consent: The political economy of the mass media [Google Books version]. Retrieved from: books.google.ca/books?id=18IWX4hxHNUC&pg=PR3&source=gbs_selected_pages&cad=2#v=onepage&q&f=false
- Herman, E. S. (2000). The propaganda model: A retrospective. *Journalism Studies*, 1(1), 101-112. doi:10.1080/146167000361195
- Jaclyn Hill. (2016, July 29). Kylie Kyshadow Palette | Tutorial + First Impressions. Retrieved from: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=evRtM3kuWBU>
- Kylie Jenner. (n.d.). *Jaclyn Hill's First Impression of Kyshadow*. Retrieved from <https://www.thekyliejenner.com/glam/1121-kylie-jenner-jaclyn-hill-first-impression-kyshadow/>
- Kaur, K., Arumugam, N., & Yunus, N. M. (2013). Beauty product advertisements: A critical discourse analysis. *Asian Social Science*, 9(3), 61. doi:10.5539/ass.v9n3p61.
- Kim, J. (2012). The institutionalization of YouTube: From user-generated content to professionally generated content. *Media, Culture & Society*, 34(1), 53-67. doi: 10.1177/0163443711427199
- Lazar, M. (2011). The right to be beautiful: Postfeminist identity and consumer beauty advertising. *New Femininities*. DOI: 10.1057/9780230294523_3

TRUST ME, YOU SHOULD BUY THIS

Lee, J. E., & Watkins, B. (2016). YouTube vloggers' influence on consumer luxury brand perceptions and intentions. *Journal of Business Research*, 69(12), 5753-5760. doi: 10.1016/j.jbusres.2016.04.171

Lippmann, W. (1922). Public opinion. MacMillan Co. Retrieved from books2.scholarsportal.info.ezproxy.lib.ryerson.ca/viewdoc.html?id=/ebooks/ebooks0/apa/2015-09-23/1/201536357#tabview=tab1.

Manny Mua. (2016, November 4). Kylie Jenner Burgundy Palette Review and Tutorial | Is it Worth it? Retrieved from: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LzztvCbcyLY>

NikkieTutorials. (2016, November 6). Kylie Jenner THE Burgundy Palette | Review + Tutorial. Retrieved from: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=yNJnHykjDVo>

Quandt, T. (2012). What's left of trust in a network society? an evolutionary model and critical discussion of trust and societal communication. *European Journal of Communication*, 27(1), 7-21. doi:10.1177/0267323111434452

Woodward-Smith, E., & Eynullaeva, E. (2009). A cross-cultural study of the translation and adaptation of advertisements for beauty products. *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology*, 17(2), 121-136. doi: 10.1080/09076760902999225

Wu, K. (2016). YouTube marketing: Legality of sponsorship and endorsements in advertising. *Business & Ethics* 2, 1-46. Retrieved from <https://works.bepress.com>